

# **VALUES, RATIONALITY, AND POWER**

# CRITICAL MANAGEMENT STUDIES

Series Editor: Albert J. Mills

# **VALUES, RATIONALITY, AND POWER: DEVELOPING ORGANIZATIONAL WISDOM**

A Case Study of a Canadian  
Healthcare Authority

BY

**BRAD C. ANDERSON**

*Kwantlen Polytechnic University, Canada*



United Kingdom – North America – Japan – India – Malaysia – China

Emerald Publishing Limited  
Howard House, Wagon Lane, Bingley BD16 1WA, UK

First edition 2019

Copyright © 2019 Emerald Publishing Limited

**Reprints and permissions service**

Contact: [permissions@emeraldinsight.com](mailto:permissions@emeraldinsight.com)

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, transmitted in any form or by any means electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without either the prior written permission of the publisher or a licence permitting restricted copying issued in the UK by The Copyright Licensing Agency and in the USA by The Copyright Clearance Center. Any opinions expressed in the chapters are those of the authors. Whilst Emerald makes every effort to ensure the quality and accuracy of its content, Emerald makes no representation implied or otherwise, as to the chapters' suitability and application and disclaims any warranties, express or implied, to their use.

**British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data**

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN: 978-1-83867-942-2 (Print)

ISBN: 978-1-83867-941-5 (Online)

ISBN: 978-1-83909-091-2 (EPub)

ISSN: 2059-6561



ISOQAR certified  
Management System,  
awarded to Emerald  
for adherence to  
Environmental  
standard  
ISO 14001:2004.

Certificate Number 1985  
ISO 14001



INVESTOR IN PEOPLE

# Contents

List of Figures	<i>ix</i>
List of Tables	<i>xiii</i>
About the Author	<i>xvii</i>
Acknowledgements	<i>xix</i>
<b>Chapter 1 Study Overview</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1. Introduction to Organizational Wisdom, Values, Rationality, and Power	2
1.2. Introduction of Theoretical Frameworks and Research Questions	4
1.3. Summary of Methodology	5
1.4. Overview of Results	6
1.5. Summary of Discussion	9
<b>Chapter 2 Overview of Organizational Wisdom</b>	<b>13</b>
2.1. Wisdom: What Is It?	13
2.2. Can Organizations Act Wisely?	15
2.3. Do Organizations Need to Act Wisely?	16
2.4. Elements of Organizational Wisdom	18
<b>Chapter 3 Values and Rationality</b>	<b>25</b>
3.1. Conceptualizations of Values in Public Sector Organizations	25
3.2. Conceptualizations of Rationality in Organizations	29
<b>Chapter 4 Power and the Nature of Pluralistic Organizations</b>	<b>37</b>
4.1. Conceptualizations of Power	37
4.2. Pluralistic Organizations: How Wise Are They?	47
<b>Chapter 5 Theoretical Frameworks</b>	<b>53</b>
5.1. Philosophical Framing: Critical Realism	53
5.2. Phronetic Research	59

<b>Chapter 6 Methods</b>	63
6.1. A Qualitative Approach	63
6.2. Case study: The Seniors Programme	63
6.3. Overview of the Development and Implementation of the Seniors Programme	65
6.4. Data Sources	70
6.5. Data Analysis	73
<b>Chapter 7 The Values Inherent in the Seniors Programme</b>	79
7.1. What Attracted People to the Seniors Programme?	80
7.2. Values the Seniors Programme Intended to Achieve	86
7.3. Were the Values of the Seniors Programme Consistent with the Canada Health Act?	87
<b>Chapter 8 Managing Executive Resistance</b>	91
8.1. Why Did Some Managers Not Support the Seniors Programme?	91
8.2. How Did Managers Resist the Seniors Programme?	95
8.3. Building Support for the Seniors Programme	97
8.4. Maintaining Executive Support	103
<b>Chapter 9 Binding the Organization to the Seniors Programme</b>	111
9.1. People – Building the Engine Room	112
9.2. Structure – Protecting and Arming Your People	116
9.3. Collaboration – Creating a Force Field of Commitment	118
<b>Chapter 10 Multiple Rationalities at Play</b>	125
10.1. Learning How to Prevent Frailty	125
10.2. Reconciling Differences between Regions	127
10.3. Selecting the BC Coaching Organization	129
10.4. Defining Rationality	131
<b>Chapter 11 Reifying Power</b>	147
11.1. Shared Values as a Basis for Producing Power Relations	147
11.2. Reifying Power through Bureaucratic Rationality	149
11.3. Empowerment – Letting Contextual and Body Rationalities Rise	152
11.4. Building and Maintaining Power Structures through Communication	155
11.5. Shielding Workers from Political Turmoil	156

<b>Chapter 12 Structures Constraining Spread</b>	<b>159</b>
12.1. Was the Initial Goal to Spread the Seniors Programme?	159
12.2. Was the Collaboration Successful?	164
12.3. Structures Constraining Spread	166
<b>Chapter 13 Structures Enabling Spread</b>	<b>175</b>
13.1. Leadership	175
13.2. Programme Champions	177
13.3. Programme Characteristics	179
13.4. Developing the eCGA	181
13.5. Supporting GPs	182
13.6. Changes in How the Province Delivered Primary Care	184
13.7. Convincing Regions to Adopt Seniors Programme	186
<b>Chapter 14 Discussion: Values, Rationality, and Power</b>	<b>189</b>
14.1. Values	190
14.2. Rationality	192
14.3. How Did Power Affect the Process of Developing and Implementing the Seniors Programme in the BC Health Authority?	194
<b>Chapter 15 Was the Use of Power Consistent with the Values of Canada’s Healthcare System?</b>	<b>207</b>
15.1. Approach to Values	207
15.2. Approach to Rationalities	208
15.3. Building Bridges, Not Burning Them	210
15.4. Using Power to Reconcile, Not Defeat	210
15.5. But ...	211
<b>Chapter 16 What’s to Be Done? Facilitating the Development of Organizational Wisdom</b>	<b>215</b>
16.1. Values Guide Wise Action	215
16.2. Knowledge Is Required, But Insufficient for Wise Action	221
16.3. Wisdom Is Action-oriented	228
<b>Chapter 17 Wisdom’s Future</b>	<b>237</b>
17.1. This Study’s Contribution: Where Are We at Now?	237
17.2. A Call to Educators, Trainers, Mentors, and Coaches: Implementing Pedagogy that Creates a Foundation for Wise Action	239

**viii** *Contents*

17.3. A Call to Scholars: Further Developing Our Understanding of How to Facilitate Organizational Wisdom	245
17.4. In Closing ...	248
<b>Appendix</b>	249
A.1. Appendix: Interview Questions	249
References	255
Index	271



# List of Figures

## Chapter 5

Figure 5.1.	Critical Realism’s Stratified Ontology. . . . .	54
-------------	---	----

## Chapter 6

Figure 6.1.	Organizational Structure of the Seniors Programme. . .	69
Figure 6.2.	Timeline of the Seniors Programme. . . . .	69

## Chapter 8

Figure 8.1.	A Critical Realist Perspective of the Reasons Some VPs Did Not Support the Training Fellowship. . . .	94
Figure 8.2.	A Critical Realist Perspective of the Means of Resistance to the Training Fellowship. . . . .	96
Figure 8.3(a–c).	A Critical Realist Perspective of the Means of Building Support for the Training Fellowship. (a) Collective Decision-making. (b) Appeal to Values and CEO Power. (c) Appeal to Rationality. . . . .	102
Figure 8.4(a–c).	A Critical Realist Perspective of the Elements of Building and Maintaining Support for the Seniors Programme. (a) The Role of Positive Results in Building and Maintaining Support for the Seniors Programme. (b) Maintaining Support during CEO Transitions. (c) The Role of Communications in Maintaining and Building Support for the Seniors Programme. . . . .	109

## Chapter 9

Figure 9.1(a–b).	A Critical Realist Perspective of the Attributes of People That Kept the Seniors Programme Alive. (a) Sources of Optimism and Enthusiasm; Ability to Build Supportive Infrastructure and Stakeholder Relations. (b) Willingness to Adapt and Do the Work Required for the Project.. . . .	115
Figure 9.2(a–b).	A Critical Realist Perspective of the Role of Documentation in Keeping the Seniors Programme Alive. (a) The Project Charter. (b) The Project Charter’s Role in Bringing CEO2 to Ottawa.. . . .	120

Figure 9.3(a–b). A Critical Realist Perspective of the Role of Collaboration in Keeping the Seniors Programme Alive. (a) Perceptions of the Collaboration at Senior Management Levels. (b) The Role of Collaboration in Gaining CEO2’s Support for the Senior Programme. . . . . 123

**Chapter 10**

Figure 10.1. A Critical Realist Perspective of the Means of Preliminary Research. . . . . 127

Figure 10.2. A Critical Realist Perspective of Managing the Differences in Patient Population between the BC and NS Health Authorities. . . . . 129

Figure 10.3. A Critical Realist Perspective of the Selection of the BC Coaching Organization. . . . . 131

Figure 10.4(a–c). A Critical Realist Perspective of the Elements of Defining the Target Patient Population. (a) Establishing the Need and Responsibility for Defining the Target Patient Population. (b) Identifying Candidate Terms to Define the Target Patient Population. (c) Selecting the Term Used to Define the Target Patient Population. . . . . 136

Figure 10.5(a–d). A Critical Realist Perspective of the Elements of the Vision Statement. (a) Developing the Vision Statement. (b) Mixed Reviews of the Vision Statement. (c) How Olga’s Story Defied People’s Perception of Ageing and Frailty. (d) Using the Vision Statement and Olga’s Story to Redefine Rationality. . . . . 144

**Chapter 11**

Figure 11.1. A Critical Realist Perspective of the Motivational Capacity of Shared Values. . . . . 149

Figure 11.2(a–b). A Critical Realist Perspective of Reifying Power through Bureaucratic Rationality. (a) Clarity of Goals, Procedures, and Flow of Information. (b) Processes within the BC Coaching Organization. . . . . 152

Figure 11.3. A Critical Realist Perspective of Empowerment. . . . . 154

Figure 11.4. A Critical Realist Perspective of Communication. . . . . 156

Figure 11.5. A Critical Realist Perspective of Shielding Workers from Political Turmoil. . . . . 158

**Chapter 12**

Figure 12.1(a–c).	A Critical Realist Perspective of the Elements of the Intention to Spread the Seniors Programme. (a) Reasons to Spread Seniors Programme. (b) Pan-Canadian versus Regional Spread. (c) A Staged Approach to Spread. . . . .	163
Figure 12.2.	A Critical Realist Perspective of the Elements of the Fellowship’s Assessment of the Collaboration. . . . .	166
Figure 12.3(a–c).	A Critical Realist Perspective of the Elements Posing Barriers to Spread. (a) How Risk Tolerance and Payment Structures Posed Barriers to Spread. (b) How Diverse Systems Posed Barriers to Spread. (c) How Managing Daily Pressures in Healthcare Regions Posed Barriers to Spread. . . . .	172

**Chapter 13**

Figure 13.1.	A Critical Realist Perspective of How Leadership Can Facilitate Spread. . . . .	177
Figure 13.2.	A Critical Realist Perspective of the Attributes of People that Facilitate Spread. . . . .	179
Figure 13.3.	A Critical Realist Perspective of Programme Characteristics that Facilitate Spread. . . . .	180
Figure 13.4.	A Critical Realist Perspective of How the Development of eCGA Facilitated Spread.. . . .	182
Figure 13.5.	A Critical Realist Perspective of Providing Support to Physicians to Facilitate Spread.. . . .	183
Figure 13.6.	A Critical Realist Perspective of How Changes to Primary Care Facilitate Spread. . . . .	185
Figure 13.7.	A Critical Realist Perspective of How to Approach Regions to Facilitate Spread.. . . .	187

# List of Tables

## Chapter 1

Table 1.1.	Research Questions. . . . .	4
------------	-----------------------------	---

## Chapter 3

Table 3.1.	Public Values Emphasized in Canada’s 2003 Values and Ethics Code for the Public Service as Identified by Beck Jørgensen and Sørensen (2013). . . . .	26
Table 3.2.	Cross-reference of Canada Health Act Objectives with Public Values. . . . .	27
Table 3.3.	Cross-reference of the BC Health Authority’s Vision, Purpose, and Values with Public Values. . . . .	27

## Chapter 6

Table 6.1.	Organizations Involved in the Seniors Programme. . . . .	66
Table 6.2.	Key Individuals Involved in the Seniors Programme. . . . .	67
Table 6.3.	Summary of Documents Analysed. . . . .	72
Table 6.4.	Summary of Interviews. . . . .	73
Table 6.5.	Codes Used during Data Analysis. . . . .	75

## Chapter 7

Table 7.1.	Summary of the Enabling Structures of Values, Rationality, and Power That Led Interviewees to Become Involved in the Seniors Programme. . . . .	81
Table 7.2.	Comparison of Values in the Project Charter versus Those Interviewees Perceived in the Seniors Programme. . . . .	87
Table 7.3.	Comparison of Values in the Canada Health Act versus Those Interviewees Perceived in the Seniors Programme. . . . .	88

## Chapter 8

Table 8.1.	Reasons Some VPs Did Not Support the Training Fellowship and Their Relation to Values, Rationality, and Power. . . . .	93
Table 8.2.	Means of Resistance to the Training Fellowship and Their Relation to Values, Rationality, and Power. . . . .	96
Table 8.3.	Means of Building Support for the Training Fellowship and Their Relation to Values, Rationality, and Power. . . . .	101

Table 8.4.	Elements of Building and Maintaining Support for the Seniors Programme and Their Relation to Values, Rationality, and Power. . . . .	108
------------	--	-----

**Chapter 9**

Table 9.1.	Attributes of People That Kept the Seniors Programme Alive and Their Relation to Values, Rationality, and Power. . . . .	114
Table 9.2.	Role of Documentation in Keeping the Seniors Programme Alive and Its Relation to Values, Rationality, and Power. . . . .	119
Table 9.3.	Role of Collaboration in Keeping the Seniors Programme Alive and Its Relation to Values, Rationality, and Power. . . . .	122

**Chapter 10**

Table 10.1.	Means of Preliminary Research and Their Relation to Values, Rationality, and Power. . . . .	127
Table 10.2.	Challenges the Fellowship Had Managing the Differences in Patient Population between the BC and NS Health Authorities and Their Relation to Values, Rationality, and Power. . . . .	128
Table 10.3.	Selecting the BC Coaching Organization and Its Relation to Values, Rationality, and Power. . . . .	130
Table 10.4.	Elements of Defining the Target Patient Population and Their Relation to Values, Rationality, and Power. . . . .	135
Table 10.5.	Elements of the Vision Statement and Their Relation to Values, Rationality, and Power. . . . .	143

**Chapter 11**

Table 11.1.	Elements of the Motivational Capacity of Shared Values and Their Relation to Values, Rationality, and Power. . . . .	148
Table 11.2.	Elements of Reifying Power through Bureaucratic Rationality and Their Relation to Values, Rationality, and Power. . . . .	151
Table 11.3.	Elements of Empowerment and Their Relation to Values, Rationality, and Power. . . . .	154
Table 11.4.	Elements of Communication and Their Relation to Values, Rationality, and Power. . . . .	156
Table 11.5.	Elements of Shielding Workers from Political Turmoil and Their Relation to Values, Rationality, and Power. . . . .	157

**Chapter 12**

Table 12.1. Elements of the Intention to Spread the Seniors Programme and Their Relation to Values, Rationality, and Power. . . . 162

Table 12.2. Elements of the BC Working Group’s Assessment of the Collaboration and Their Relation to Values, Rationality, and Power. . . . . 165

Table 12.3. Elements Posing Barriers to Spread and Their Relation to Values, Rationality, and Power. . . . . 171

**Chapter 13**

Table 13.1. Elements of How Leadership Facilitated Spread and Their Relation to Values, Rationality, and Power. . . . . 176

Table 13.2. Elements of How Programme Champions Facilitated Spread and Their Relation to Values, Rationality, and Power. . . . 178

Table 13.3. Elements of How Programme Characteristics Facilitated Spread and Their Relation to Values, Rationality, and Power. . . . . 180

Table 13.4. Elements of How Developing the eCGA Facilitated Spread and Their Relation to Values, Rationality, and Power. . . . 181

Table 13.5. Elements of How Supporting GPs Facilitated Spread and Their Relation to Values, Rationality, and Power. . . . . 183

Table 13.6. Elements of How Changes to the Delivery of Primary Care Facilitated Spread and Their Relation to Values, Rationality, and Power. . . . . 185

Table 13.7. Elements of How the Methods Used to Approach Regions Facilitated Spread and Their Relation to Values, Rationality, and Power. . . . . 187

**Chapter 16**

Table 16.1. Summary of Propositions and Recommendations. . . . . 216

**Chapter 17**

Table 17.1. A Framework for Educators to Develop Organizational and Managerial Wisdom. . . . . 242

## About the Author

**Dr Brad C. Anderson** teaches business at Kwantlen Polytechnic University, focusing on operations management as well as business analysis and decision-making. Prior to that, he worked as a scientist in the biotech industry where he made drugs for a living (legally!). In addition to his teaching and research interests, he is a published science fiction author. Learn more about him and his work at [www.bradanderson2000.com](http://www.bradanderson2000.com).

# Acknowledgements

There are many people to whom I owe a debt of gratitude. Dr. Gabrielle Durepos devoted a tremendous amount of time, effort, and thought into helping me shape this book into what it is. This work would be a mere shadow of itself without her guidance and support. Likewise, Dr. Janice Thomas made the time to take me on as a graduate student despite an already vast array of responsibilities. It was she who introduced me to Bent Flyvbjerg's book *Making Social Science Matter: Why Social Inquiry Fails and How It Can Succeed Again*. There are books that change lives, and this book changed mine. I also wish to thank Drs. Gloria Filax, Gina Grandy, and Jim Grant, who took the time to review and provide feedback on my research. Their insights and challenging questions only made this work stronger.

There are many within my research setting to whom I owe thanks. To maintain their confidentiality, however, I can only refer to them by their code names. The Mentor was the first person in the BC Health Authority to introduce me to the Seniors Programme. From day one, she showed interest and passion for my research. Similarly, the Site Director was incredibly supportive, giving me access to a treasure trove of documents. These two plus my other interviewees, the MD Lead, Head Coach, Senior Improvement Lead, CEO1 and CEO2, gave generously their time participating in my interviews. Associated with many of these individuals and the research ethics boards I interacted with are unsung heroes: executive assistants and administrators with whom I worked to arrange meetings, organize interviews, and guide paperwork through the labyrinthine complexity of bureaucracy. Without the generosity and support of these people, this research would not exist.