RESEARCH IN THE HISTORY OF ECONOMIC THOUGHT AND METHODOLOGY

Including a Symposium on Religion, the Scottish Enlightenment, and the Rise of Liberalism

Guest edited by Jordan J. Ballor and Erik W. Matson

Edited by Luca Fiorito, Scott Scheall and Carlos Eduardo Suprinyak

RESEARCH IN THE HISTORY
OF ECONOMIC THOUGHT
AND METHODOLOGY

VOLUME 41A

RESEARCH IN THE HISTORY OF ECONOMIC THOUGHT AND METHODOLOGY

RESEARCH IN THE HISTORY OF ECONOMIC THOUGHT AND METHODOLOGY

Founding Editor: Warren J. Samuels (1933–2011)

Series Editors: Luca Fiorito, Scott Scheall and Carlos Eduardo Suprinyak

Recent Volumes:

Volume 37A:	Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: Including a
	Symposium on 50 Years of the Union for Radical Political Economics; 2019
Volume 37B:	Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: Including a
	Symposium on Ludwig Lachmann; 2019
Volume 37C:	Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: Including a
	Symposium on Robert Heilbroner at 100; 2019
Volume 38A:	Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: Including a
	Symposium on Public Finance in the History of Economic Thought; 2020
Volume 38B:	Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: Including
	a Symposium on Economists and Authoritarian Regimes in the 20th Century;
	2020
Volume 38C:	Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: Including a
	Symposium on Sir James Steuart: The Political Economy of Money and Trade;
	2020
Volume 39A:	Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: Including a
	Selection of Papers Presented at the 2019 ALAHPE Conference; 2021
Volume 39B:	Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: Including a
	Symposium on Carl Menger at the Centenary of his Death; 2021
Volume 39C:	Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: Including a
	Symposium on Frank Knight's Risk, Uncertainty, and Profit at 100; 2021
Volume 40A:	Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: Including a
	Symposium on David Gordon: American Radical Economist; 2022
Volume 40B:	Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: Including a
	Symposium On the Work of William J. Baumol: Heterodox Inspirations and
	Neoclassical Models; 2022
Volume 40C:	Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: Including a
	Symposium on the Work of François Perroux; 2022

EDITORIAL BOARD

Michele Alacevich University of Bologna, Italy

Rebeca Gomez Betancourt University of Lumière Lyon 2, France

John Davis Marquette University, USA; University of Amsterdam, The Netherlands

Till Düppe Université du Québec à Montréal, Canada

Ross B. Emmett
Arizona State University, USA

Andrew Farrant Dickinson College, USA

Nicola Giocoli University of Pisa, Italy Harald Hagemann University of Hohenheim, Germany

Tiago Mata University College, London, UK

Steven Medema

Duke University, USA

Gary Mongiovi St. John's University, USA

Mary Morgan

London School of Economics,

London, UK

Maria Pia Paganelli Trinity University, USA

Gerardo Serra University of Manchester, UK



RESEARCH IN THE HISTORY OF ECONOMIC THOUGHT AND METHODOLOGY VOLUME 41A

RESEARCH IN THE HISTORY OF ECONOMIC THOUGHT AND METHODOLOGY: INCLUDING A SYMPOSIUM ON RELIGION, THE SCOTTISH ENLIGHTENMENT, AND THE RISE OF LIBERALISM

EDITED BY

LUCA FIORITO

University of Palermo, Italy

AND

SCOTT SCHEALL

Arizona State University, USA

CARLOS EDUARDO SUPRINYAK

American University of Paris, France



United Kingdom – North America – Japan India – Malaysia – China Emerald Publishing Limited Emerald Publishing, Floor 5, Northspring, 21-23 Wellington Street, Leeds LS1 4DL.

First edition 2023

Editorial matter and selection © 2023 Luca Fiorito, Scott Scheall, and Carlos Eduardo Suprinyak. Published under exclusive licence by Emerald Publishing Limited. Individual chapters © 2023 Emerald Publishing Limited.

Reprints and permissions service

Contact: www.copyright.com

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, transmitted in any form or by any means electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without either the prior written permission of the publisher or a licence permitting restricted copying issued in the UK by The Copyright Licensing Agency and in the USA by The Copyright Clearance Center. Any opinions expressed in the chapters are those of the authors. Whilst Emerald makes every effort to ensure the quality and accuracy of its content, Emerald makes no representation implied or otherwise, as to the chapters' suitability and application and disclaims any warranties, express or implied, to their use.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN: 978-1-83549-517-9 (Print) ISBN: 978-1-83549-516-2 (Online) ISBN: 978-1-83549-518-6 (Epub)

ISSN: 0743-4154 (Series)



CONTENTS

About the Editors	
List of Contributors	
Volume Introduction	
PART I A SYMPOSIUM ON RELIGION, THE SCOTTISH ENLIGHTENMENT, AND THE RISE OF LIBERALISM Edited by Jordan J. Ballor and Erik W. Matson	
Chapter 1 Introduction to the Symposium: Religion, the Scottish Enlightenment, and the Rise of Liberalism Jordan J. Ballor and Erik W. Matson	3
Chapter 2 Believing, Belonging and Understanding: Religion and Philosophy as Narratives and Practice in Adam Smith <i>Jimena Hurtado</i>	11
Chapter 3 Adam Smith and Religious Mercantilism Maria Pia Paganelli	27
Chapter 4 The Quest for Adam Smith's Theodicy Paul Oslington	37
Chapter 5 The Circumstantiality of Bivariate Relationships in The <i>Theory of Moral Sentiments</i> Daniel B. Klein	59
Chapter 6 The Anthropology of Liberalism: Smith and Us Christina McRorie	<i>79</i>
Chapter 7 Opposing Sketches of the Clergy as Literati During the Scottish Enlightenment: Hugh Blair and John Witherspoon Paul D. Mueller	99

viii CONTENTS

PART II ESSAY

Chapter 8 Description as Theory: Sen and Sraffa Syed Mohib Ali	121
PART III ROUNDTABLE ON GEOFFREY HODGSON'S "DISCOVERING INSTITUTIONALISM: ONE PERSON'S JOURNEY"	
Chapter 9 Discovering Institutionalism: One Person's Journey Geoffrey Hodgson	141
Chapter 10 Geoffrey Hodgson's Institutional Economics: Veblenian Origins and Beyond Felipe Almeida	159
Chapter 11 Can Institutional Economics Still Fascinate Scholars? Angela Ambrosino	169
Chapter 12 Why Is Geoffrey Hodgson So Important for Institutional and Evolutionary Economics? Some Personal Views Olivier Brette	181
Chapter 13 Geoffrey Hodgson: An Institutionalist's Institutionalist Daniel H. Cole	189
Chapter 14 Journeying toward Institutionalism Richard N. Langlois	195
Chapter 15 Learning Economics. Discovering Geoff Hodgson Alain Marciano	205
Chapter 16 The Three Scientific Faults in Some Neo-Institutionalism Deirde Nansen McCloskey	209
Chapter 17 The Institutional Economics of Geoffrey Hodgson: Some Distinctive Foundations David Dequech	219

ABOUT THE EDITORS

Luca Fiorito received his PhD in Economics from the New School for Social Research in New York and is currently Professor at the University of Palermo. His main area of interest is the history of American economic thought in the Progressive Era and the interwar years. He has published many works on the contributions of the institutionalists and on the relationship between economics and eugenics.

Scott Scheall is Assistant Professor in the Faculty of Social Science in Arizona State University's College of Integrative Sciences and Arts. He has published extensively on topics related to the history and philosophy of the Austrian School of economics. Scott is the author of *F. A. Hayek and the Epistemology of Politics: The Curious Task of Economics* (Routledge, 2020)

Carlos Eduardo Suprinyak is Associate Professor of Economics at the American University of Paris. He specializes in the history of political economy, exploring the intersections between economics and politics in different historical contexts, from early modern England to Cold War Latin America. Besides numerous papers in peer-reviewed journals, he is also co-editor of *The Political Economy of Latin American Independence* (Routledge, 2017) and *Political Economy and International Order in Interwar Europe* (Palgrave, 2020).



LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

Syed Mohib Ali University of Siena, Siena, Italy

Felipe Almeida Federal University of Paraná, Curitiba, Brazil

Angela Ambrosino University of Turin, Turin, Italy

Jordan J. Ballor Center for Religion, Culture & Democracy, Plano,

TX, USA

Olivier Brette University of Lyon, Lyon, France

Daniel H. ColeIndiana University, Bloomington, IN, USADavid DequechUniversity of Campinas, São Paulo, Brazil

Luca Fiorito University of Palermo, Palermo, Italy

Geoffrey Hodgson Loughborough University London, London,

England, UK

Jimena HurtadoUniversidad de los Andes, Bogotá, ColombiaDaniel B. KleinGeorge Mason University, Fairfax, VA, USARichard N. LangloisUniversity of Connecticut, Storrs, CT, USA

Alain Marciano University of Montpellier and MRE, Montpellier,

France

Erik W. Matson Mercatus Center at George Mason University,

Arlington, VA, USA

Deirdre Nansen McCloskey University of Illinois Chicago, Chicago, IL, USA

Christina McRorie Creighton University, Omaha, NE, USA
Paul D. Mueller The King's College, New York, NY, USA

Paul Oslington Alphacrucis College Sydney, Sydney, Australia,

and PACT / ACC&C, Charles Sturt University,

Canberra, Australia

Maria Pia Paganelli Trinity University, San Antonio, TX, USA

Scott Scheall Arizona State University Polytechnic Campus,

Mesa, AZ, USA

Carlos Eduardo Suprinyak American University of Paris, Paris, France



VOLUME INTRODUCTION

Volume 41A of *Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology* features a symposium on "Religion, the Scottish Enlightenment, and the Rise of Liberalism," guest edited by Jordan J. Ballor and Erik W. Matson. The symposium includes contributions from Jimena Hurtado, Maria Pia Paganelli, Paul Oslington, Daniel B. Klein, Christina McRorie, and Paul D. Mueller.

The volume also features a new research essay by Syed Mohib Ali that considers Amartya Sen's interpretation of Piero Sraffa's work.

Volume 41A also includes a roundtable addressing a new essay by esteemed economist Geoffrey Hodgson in which Hodgson reflects on the role that institutionalist economics has played in his work. The roundtable features contributions from Felipe Almeida, Angela Ambrosino, Daniel H. Cole, Richard N. Langlois, Alain Marciano, and Deirdre McCloskey.

The Editors of Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology

Luca Fiorito

Scott Scheall

Carlos Eduardo Suprinyak