

RESEARCH IN THE HISTORY OF  
ECONOMIC THOUGHT AND  
METHODOLOGY: INCLUDING  
A SYMPOSIUM ON NEW  
DIRECTIONS IN SRAFFA  
SCHOLARSHIP

# RESEARCH IN THE HISTORY OF ECONOMIC THOUGHT AND METHODOLOGY

Founding Editor: Warren J. Samuels (1933–2011)

Series Editors: Luca Fiorito, Scott Scheall, and  
Carlos Eduardo Suprinyak

## Recent Volumes:

- Volume 31A: Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: A Research Annual; Jeff E. Biddle, Ross B. Emmett; 2013
- Volume 31B: Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: Documents Related to John Maynard Keynes, Institutionalism at Chicago & Frank H. Knight; Ross B. Emmett; 2013
- Volume 32: Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: A Research Annual; Luca Fiorito; 2014
- Volume 33: Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: A Research Annual; Luca Fiorito, Scott Scheall, Carlos Eduardo Suprinyak; 2015
- Volume 34A: Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: Including a Symposium on Austrian Economics in the Postwar Era; Luca Fiorito, Scott Scheall, Carlos Eduardo Suprinyak; 2016
- Volume 34B: Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: Including a Symposium on Albert O. Hirschman; Luca Fiorito, Scott Scheall, Carlos Eduardo Suprinyak; 2016
- Volume 35A: Research in the History of Economic Thought and Methodology: Including a Symposium on the Historical Epistemology of Economics; Luca Fiorito, Scott Scheall, Carlos Eduardo Suprinyak; 2017

RESEARCH IN THE HISTORY OF ECONOMIC THOUGHT  
AND METHODOLOGY VOLUME 35B

**RESEARCH IN THE  
HISTORY OF ECONOMIC  
THOUGHT AND  
METHODOLOGY:  
INCLUDING A SYMPOSIUM  
ON NEW DIRECTIONS IN  
SRAFFA SCHOLARSHIP**

EDITED BY

**LUCA FIORITO**

*University of Palermo, Palermo, Italy*

**SCOTT SCHEALL**

*Arizona State University Polytechnic Campus, Mesa, AZ, USA*

**CARLOS EDUARDO SUPRINYAK**

*Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais, Belo Horizonte, Brazil*



United Kingdom – North America – Japan  
India – Malaysia – China

Emerald Publishing Limited  
Howard House, Wagon Lane, Bingley BD16 1WA, UK

First edition 2018

Copyright © 2018 Emerald Publishing Limited

**Reprints and permissions service**

Contact: [permissions@emeraldinsight.com](mailto:permissions@emeraldinsight.com)

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, transmitted in any form or by any means electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without either the prior written permission of the publisher or a licence permitting restricted copying issued in the UK by The Copyright Licensing Agency and in the USA by The Copyright Clearance Center. Any opinions expressed in the chapters are those of the authors. Whilst Emerald makes every effort to ensure the quality and accuracy of its content, Emerald makes no representation implied or otherwise, as to the chapters' suitability and application and disclaims any warranties, express or implied, to their use.

**British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data**

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN: 978-1-78714-540-5 (Print)

ISBN: 978-1-78714-539-9 (Online)

ISBN: 978-1-78714-968-7 (Epub)

ISSN: 0743-4154 (Series)



ISOQAR certified  
Management System,  
awarded to Emerald  
for adherence to  
Environmental  
standard  
ISO 14001:2004.

Certificate Number 1985  
ISO 14001



INVESTOR IN PEOPLE

# CONTENTS

LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS	<i>ix</i>
EDITORIAL BOARD	<i>xi</i>
ABOUT THE EDITORS	<i>xiii</i>
VOLUME INTRODUCTION	<i>xv</i>

## PART I A SYMPOSIUM ON NEW DIRECTIONS IN SRAFFA SCHOLARSHIP

SYMPOSIUM: NEW DIRECTIONS IN SRAFFA SCHOLARSHIP <i>Riccardo Bellofiore and Scott Carter</i>	<i>3</i>
DOCUMENTS ON PIERO SRAFFA AT THE ARCHIVIO CENTRALE DELLO STATO AND AT THE ARCHIVIO STORICO DIPLOMATICO <i>Eleonora Lattanzi and Nerio Naldi</i>	<i>61</i>
FRIENDSHIP AND INTELLECTUAL INTERCOURSE BETWEEN SRAFFA AND WITTGENSTEIN: A TIMELINE <i>Lucia Morra</i>	<i>101</i>
SRAFFA'S 1920s CRITIQUE AND ITS RELEVANCE FOR THE ASSESSMENT OF MAINSTREAM MICROECONOMICS <i>Gabriel Brondino and Andres Lazzarini</i>	<i>131</i>
SRAFFA ON THE OPEN VERSUS "CLOSED SYSTEMS" DISTINCTION AND CAUSALITY <i>John B. Davis</i>	<i>153</i>

THE IMPROBABILITY OF RESWITCHING, THE  
CERTAINTY OF WICKSELL-EFFECTS AND THE  
POVERTY OF PRODUCTION FUNCTIONS: THE  
CAMBRIDGE CRITIQUE OF CAPITAL TRANSFORMED  
*Bertram Schefold* 171

SRAFFA, THE CONFIGURATION OF EXCHANGE, AND  
VALUE/PRICE EXPRESSIONS OF LABOUR TIME IN  
SURPLUS-PRODUCING TRIANGULAR TRADE  
*Scott Carter* 195

**PART II  
ESSAYS**

THE GREAT DEPRESSION AND MACROECONOMICS  
RECONSIDERED: THE IMPACT OF POLICY AND  
REAL-WORLD EVENTS ON ECONOMIC DOCTRINES  
*Masazumi Wakatabe* 237

TWO-POPULATION SOCIAL CYCLE THEORIES  
*Gene Callahan and Andreas Hoffmann* 303

**PART III  
A COLLECTION OF REVIEWS OF THOMAS C. LEONARD'S  
*ILLIBERAL REFORMERS: RACE, EUGENICS, AND  
AMERICAN ECONOMICS IN THE PROGRESSIVE ERA***

NOT ALL IL-LIBERAL: ACADEMIC REFORM THOUGHT  
IN THE LONG PROGRESSIVE ERA  
*Mary O. Furner* 325

ILLIBERAL AMERICA: RETHINKING THE  
PROGRESSIVE ERA IN THE AGE OF OBAMA AND  
TRUMP  
*Matthew Frye Jacobson* 345

REFLECTIONS ON THOMAS C. LEONARD'S *ILLIBERAL  
REFORMERS*  
*Charles R. McCann, Jr.* 357

FAITH AS POLITICAL EPISTEMOLOGY: A REVIEW OF  
THOMAS C. LEONARD'S *ILLIBERAL REFORMERS*

*Scott Scheall*

375

A RESPONSE TO MY FRIENDLY CRITICS

*Thomas C. Leonard*

383

INDEX

397

## LIST OF CONTRIBUTORS

<i>Riccardo Bellofiore</i>	University of Bergamo, Bergamo, Italy
<i>Gabriel Brondino</i>	Consejo Nacional de Investigaciones Científicas y Técnicas (CONICET) and Universidad Nacional del Litoral, Santa Fe, Argentina
<i>Gene Callahan</i>	St. Joseph's College, Brooklyn, NY, USA
<i>Scott Carter</i>	The University of Tulsa, Tulsa, OK, USA
<i>John B. Davis</i>	Marquette University, Milwaukee, WI, USA; University of Amsterdam, Amsterdam, The Netherlands
<i>Luca Fiorito</i>	University of Palermo, Palermo, Italy
<i>Mary O. Furner</i>	University of California, Santa Barbara, Santa Barbara, CA, USA
<i>Andreas Hoffmann</i>	Leipzig University, Leipzig, Germany
<i>Matthew Frye Jacobson</i>	Yale University, New Haven, CT, USA
<i>Eleonora Lattanzi</i>	Sapienza University of Rome; Fondazione Istituto Gramsci, Rome, Italy
<i>Andres Lazzarini</i>	Consejo Nacional de Investigaciones Científicas y Técnicas (CONICET) and Universidad Nacional de San Martín (UNSAM), Buenos Aires, Argentina
<i>Thomas C. Leonard</i>	Princeton University, Princeton, NJ, USA
<i>Charles R. McCann, Jr.</i>	University of Pittsburgh, Pittsburgh, PA, USA
<i>Lucia Morra</i>	University of Turin, Turin, Italy
<i>Nerio Naldi</i>	Sapienza University of Rome, Rome, Italy
<i>Scott Scheall</i>	Arizona State University Polytechnic Campus, Mesa, AZ, USA



<i>Bertram Schefold</i>	Goethe University Frankfurt, Frankfurt am Main, Germany
<i>Carlos Eduardo Suprinyak</i>	Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais, Belo Horizonte, Brazil
<i>Masazumi Wakatabe</i>	Waseda University, Tokyo, Japan

## EDITORIAL BOARD

Michele Alacevich  
*University of Bologna, Italy*

Rebeca Gomez Betancourt  
*Université Lumière Lyon 2, France*

John Davis  
*Marquette University, USA;  
University of Amsterdam, The  
Netherlands*

Pedro Garcia Duarte  
*University of São Paulo, Brazil*

Till Düppe  
*Université du Québec à Montréal,  
Canada*

Ross Emmett  
*Michigan State University, USA*

Nicola Giocoli  
*University of Pisa, Italy*

Kyu Sang Lee  
*Ajou University, South Korea*

Steven Medema  
*University of Colorado Denver, USA*

Tiago Mata  
*University College, London, UK*

Maria Pia Paganelli  
*Trinity University, USA*

## ABOUT THE EDITORS

**Luca Fiorito** received his PhD in economics from the New School for Social Research in New York and is currently Associate Professor at the University of Palermo. His main area of interest is the history of American economic thought in the Progressive Era and the interwar years. He has published many works on the contributions of the institutionalists and on the relationship between economics and eugenics.

**Scott Scheall** is a Lecturer with Arizona State University's College of Integrative Sciences and Arts. He received his PhD in philosophy from Arizona State in 2012. Scott is a former Research Fellow with Duke University's Center for the History of Political Economy and a former Postdoctoral Fellow with the F.A. Hayek Program for Advanced Study in Philosophy, Politics, and Economics at George Mason University. He has published extensively on the history and methodology of the Austrian School of economics.

**Carlos Eduardo Suprinyak** is Associate Professor of Economics at the Federal University of Minas Gerais (UFMG), Brazil. He specializes in the history of economic thought and economic methodology, studying in particular the interplay between social, political, and economic ideas in early modern England, and the institutionalization of academic economics in Brazil during the postwar era. He has published several papers on these and other related themes in peer-reviewed scholarly journals, and is also the co-editor of *The Political Economy of Latin American Independence* (Routledge, 2017).

# VOLUME INTRODUCTION

Our second volume of 2017 features a symposium guest-edited by Scott Carter and Riccardo Bellofiore on recent developments in the scholarly literature on the famous Cambridge economist, Piero Sraffa. The symposium includes contributions from several eminent methodologists and Sraffa scholars, including Bertram Schefold and John Davis.

In our general-research “Essays” section, Masazumi Wakatabe offers a penetrating new analysis of the significance for the subsequent development of macroeconomics of the events of the Great Depression and the various policy efforts to mitigate it. Gene Callahan and Andreas Hoffmann review and build a preliminary model of the common aspects of endogenous theories of various cyclical social phenomena.

Finally, we present a collection of reviews of Thomas C. Leonard’s (2015) *Illiberal Reformers: Race, Eugenics, and American Economics in the Progressive Era*, winner of the History of Economics Society’s 2017 Joseph J. Spengler Best Book Prize. Contributors include Mary O. Furner, Matthew Frye Jacobson, Charles R. McCann, Jr., and RHETM co-editor Scott Scheall. Professor Leonard was kind enough to write a response to his critics.

As usual, we close by thanking our team of editorial assistants at Emerald Publishing, Charlotte Maiorana and Fiona Mattison, for working to facilitate production of this important volume.

Luca Fiorito  
Scott Scheall  
Carlos Eduardo Suprinyak  
*Editors*