

REVITALIZING COLLEGIALITY

Restoring Faculty Authority
in Universities

Edited by Kerstin Sahlin
and Ulla Eriksson-Zetterquist

Sponsored by the
ASA section on Organizations,
Occupations and Work



Open Access Book

RESEARCH IN THE
SOCIOLOGY OF ORGANIZATIONS

VOLUME 87

REVITALIZING COLLEGIALLY

RESEARCH IN THE SOCIOLOGY OF ORGANIZATIONS

Series Editor: Michael Lounsbury

- Volume 55: Social Movements, Stakeholders and Non-market Strategy
- Volume 56: Social Movements, Stakeholders and Non-market Strategy
- Volume 57: Toward Permeable Boundaries of Organizations?
- Volume 58: Agents, Actors, Actorhood: Institutional Perspectives on the Nature of Agency, Action, and Authority
- Volume 59: The Production of Managerial Knowledge and Organizational Theory: New Approaches to Writing, Producing and Consuming Theory
- Volume 60: Race, Organizations, and the Organizing Process
- Volume 61: Routine Dynamics in Action
- Volume 62: Thinking Infrastructures
- Volume 63: The Contested Moralities of Markets
- Volume 64: Managing Inter-organizational Collaborations: Process Views
- Volume 65A: Microfoundations of Institutions
- Volume 65B: Microfoundations of Institutions
- Volume 66: Theorizing the Sharing Economy: Variety and Trajectories of New Forms of Organizing
- Volume 67: Tensions and Paradoxes in Temporary Organizing
- Volume 68: Macrofoundations: Exploring the Institutionally Situated Nature of Activity
- Volume 69: Organizational Hybridity: Perspectives, Processes, Promises
- Volume 70: On Practice and Institution: Theorizing the Interface
- Volume 71: On Practice and Institution: New Empirical Directions
- Volume 72: Organizational Imaginaries: Tempering Capitalism and Tending to Communities Through Cooperatives and Collectivist Democracy
- Volume 73A: Interdisciplinary Dialogues on Organizational Paradox: Learning from Belief and Science
- Volume 73B: Interdisciplinary Dialogues on Organizational Paradox: Investigating Social Structures and Human Expression
- Volume 74: Worlds of Rankings
- Volume 75: Organizing Creativity in the Innovation Journey
- Volume 76: Carnegie Goes to California: Advancing and Celebrating the Work of James G. March
- Volume 77: The Generation, Recognition and Legitimation of Novelty
- Volume 78: The Corporation: Rethinking the Iconic Form of Business Organization
- Volume 79: Organizing for Societal Grand Challenges
- Volume 80: Advances in Cultural Entrepreneurship
- Volume 81: Entrepreneurialism and Society: New Theoretical Perspectives
- Volume 82: Entrepreneurialism and Society: Consequences and Meanings
- Volume 83: Digital Transformation and Institutional Theory
- Volume 84: Organizational Wrongdoing as the “Foundational” Grand Challenge: Definitions and Antecedents
- Volume 85: Organizational Wrongdoing as the “Foundational” Grand Challenge: Consequences and Impact
- Volume 86: University Collegiality and the Erosion of Faculty Authority

RESEARCH IN THE SOCIOLOGY OF ORGANIZATIONS ADVISORY BOARD

Series Editor

Michael Lounsbury
Professor of Strategic Management & Organization
University of Alberta School of Business, Canada

RSO Advisory Board

Howard E. Aldrich, *University of North Carolina, USA*
Shaz Ansari, *Cambridge University, UK*
Silvia Dorado Banacloche, *University of Massachusetts Boston, USA*
Christine Beckman, *University of Southern California, USA*
Marya Besharov, *Oxford University, UK*
Eva Boxenbaum, *Copenhagen Business School, Denmark*
Ed Carberry, *University of Massachusetts Boston, USA*
Lisa Cohen, *McGill University, Canada*
Jeannette Colyvas, *Northwestern University, USA*
Erica Coslor, *University of Melbourne, Australia*
Gerald F. Davis, *University of Michigan, USA*
Rich Dejordy, *California State University, USA*
Rodolphe Durand, *HEC Paris, France*
Fabrizio Ferraro, *IESE Business School, Spain*
Peer Fiss, *University of Southern California, USA*
Mary Ann Glynn, *Boston College, USA*
Nina Granqvist, *Aalto University School of Business, Finland*
Royston Greenwood, *University of Alberta, Canada*
Stine Grodal, *Northeastern University, USA*
Markus A. Hoellerer, *University of New South Wales, Australia*
Ruthanne Huising, *emlyon business school, France*
Candace Jones, *University of Edinburgh, UK*
Sarah Kaplan, *University of Toronto, Canada*
Brayden G. King, *Northwestern University, USA*
Matthew S. Kraatz, *University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, USA*
Tom Lawrence, *Oxford University, UK*
Xiaowei Rose Luo, *Insead, France*
Johanna Mair, *Hertie School, Germany*
Christopher Marquis, *Cambridge University, UK*
Renate Meyer, *Vienna University, Austria*
William Ocasio, *University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, USA*
Nelson Phillips, *University of California at Santa Barbara, USA*
Prateek Raj, *Indian Institute of Management Bangalore, India*
Marc Schneiberg, *Reed College, USA*

Marc-David Seidel, *University of British Columbia, Canada*
Paul Spee, *University of Queensland, Australia*
Paul Tracey, *Cambridge University, UK*
Kerstin Sahlin, *Uppsala University, Sweden*
Sarah Soule, *Stanford University, USA*
Eero Vaara, *University of Oxford, UK*
Marc Ventresca, *University of Oxford, UK*
Maxim Voronov, *York University, Canada*
Filippo Carlo Wezel, *USI Lugano, Switzerland*
Melissa Wooten, *Rutgers University, USA*
April Wright, *University of Queensland, Australia*
Meng Zhao, *Nanyang Business School & Renmin University, China*
Enying Zheng, *Peking University, China*
Tammar B. Zilber, *Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel*

RESEARCH IN THE SOCIOLOGY OF
ORGANIZATIONS VOLUME 87

**REVITALIZING
COLLEGIALLY:
RESTORING FACULTY
AUTHORITY IN
UNIVERSITIES**

EDITED BY

KERSTIN SAHLIN
Uppsala University, Sweden

and

ULLA ERIKSSON-ZETTERQUIST
University of Gothenburg, Sweden



United Kingdom – North America – Japan
India – Malaysia – China

Emerald Publishing Limited
Emerald Publishing, Floor 5, Northspring, 21-23 Wellington Street, Leeds LS1 4DL.

First edition 2024

Editorial matter and selection © 2024 Kerstin Sahlin and Ulla Eriksson-Zetterquist.
Individual chapters © 2024 the respective author/s.



Published under exclusive licence by Emerald Publishing Limited. These works are published under the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY 4.0) licence. Anyone may reproduce, distribute, translate and create derivative works of these works (for both commercial and non-commercial purposes), subject to full attribution to the original publication and authors. The full terms of this licence may be seen at <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/legalcode>.

Reprints and permissions service

Contact: www.copyright.com

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, transmitted in any form or by any means electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without either the prior written permission of the publisher or a licence permitting restricted copying issued in the UK by The Copyright Licensing Agency and in the USA by The Copyright Clearance Center. Any opinions expressed in the chapters are those of the authors. Whilst Emerald makes every effort to ensure the quality and accuracy of its content, Emerald makes no representation implied or otherwise, as to the chapters' suitability and application and disclaims any warranties, express or implied, to their use.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN: 978-1-80455-821-8 (Print)

ISBN: 978-1-80455-818-8 (Online)

ISBN: 978-1-80455-820-1 (Epub)

ISSN: 0733-558X (Series)



INVESTOR IN PEOPLE

CONTENTS

<i>List of Figures and Tables</i>	<i>ix</i>
<i>About the Editors</i>	<i>xi</i>
<i>About the Contributors</i>	<i>xiii</i>
<i>Foreword</i>	<i>xvii</i>

Introduction: Revitalizing Collegiality: Restoring Faculty Authority in Universities <i>Ulla Eriksson-Zetterquist and Kerstin Sahlin</i>	<i>1</i>
--	----------

SECTION 1 MAINTAINING COLLEGIALITY

How to Remain Collegial when Pressure for Change Is High? <i>Audrey Harroche and Christine Musselin</i>	<i>29</i>
Sustaining a Collegiate Environment: Collegueship, Community and Choice at an Anonymous Business School <i>Jakov Jandrić, Rick Delbridge and Paolo Quattrone</i>	<i>51</i>

SECTION 2 REVITALIZING COLLEGIALITY

An Unsettling Crisis of Collegial Governance: Reality Breakdowns as Antecedents of Institutional Awareness <i>Logan Crace, Joel Gehman and Michael Lounsbury</i>	<i>77</i>
Who's a Colleague? Professionalizing Academic Leadership as a Platform for Redefining Collegiality <i>Ravit Mizrahi-Shtelman and Gili S. Drori</i>	<i>111</i>

**Manifestations of Collegiality Within Universities:
Delocalisation and Structural Hybridity as Governance
Forms and Practices**

Jean-Louis Denis, Nancy Côté and Maggie Hébert 137

**Collegiality Washing? New Translations of Collegial
Practices**

Kerstin Sahlin and Ulla Eriksson-Zetterquist 157

**“Outroduction”: A Research Agenda on Collegiality in
University Settings**

*Nico Cloete, Nancy Côté, Logan Crace, Rick Delbridge,
Jean-Louis Denis, Gili S. Drori, Ulla Eriksson-Zetterquist,
Joel Gehman, Lisa-Maria Gerhardt, Jan Goldenstein,
Audrey Harroche, Jakov Jandrić, Anna Kosmützky,
Georg Krücken, Seungah S. Lee, Michael Lounsbury,
Ravit Mizrahi-Shtelman, Christine Musselin,
Hampus Östh Gustafsson, Pedro Pineda, Paolo Quattrone,
Francisco O. Ramirez, Kerstin Sahlin, Francois van Schalkwyk
and Peter Walgenbach* 181

LIST OF FIGURES AND TABLES

How to Remain Collegial When Pressure for Change Is High?

Table 1.	Comparative Table.	42
----------	--------------------	----

An Unsettling Crisis of Collegial Governance: Reality Breakdowns as Antecedents of Institutional Awareness

Table 1.	Summary of Prior Studies on Reality Breakdown.	80
Fig. 1.	Composition of the Governing Bodies.	86
Table 2.	Timeline of Events Leading to Reality Breakdown.	88
Table 3.	Recommendations of the Committee of the Whole.	98
Fig. 2.	Response to a Reality Breakdown.	99

Who's a Colleague? Professionalizing Academic Leadership as a Platform for Redefining Collegiality

Table 1.	Programs for Training of Academic Leadership in Israel.	121
Table 2.	Composition of the HUJI's Programs for Academic Leadership.	123
Table 3.	Composition of CHE-Rothschild Program for Academic Leadership.	124
Fig. 1.	Matrix of Options for Collaboration Between Administrative Staff and the Professoriate.	127
Table 4.	Professionalizing Leadership, Defining Collegiality.	130

Manifestations of Collegiality Within Universities: Delocalisation and Structural Hybridity as Governance Forms and Practices

Table 1.	Evolution of Faculty Positions.	144
Table 2.	Research Chairs.	145

This page intentionally left blank

ABOUT THE EDITORS

Kerstin Sahlin, since 2000, is Professor of Public Management in the Department of Business Studies at Uppsala University. Prior to her position at Uppsala, she was Professor in Public Management at Stockholm University and the Director of the Stockholm Centre for Organizational Research (SCORE). She received her PhD from Umeå University and has also held positions at the Stockholm School of Economics. She has been a Visiting Researcher at Stanford University and a number of other institutions. She has held a number of academic leadership positions. She has been Vice president of the Royal Swedish Academy of Sciences (2019–2022), Secretary General of Humanities and Social Sciences at the Swedish Research Council (2013–2018), and Deputy Vice-Chancellor of Uppsala University (2006–2011). Her major research interests include decision-making on complex projects, the expansion and translation of management ideas, organizational reforms of public sector, transnational regulation, and more recently university governance and collegiality. Her research is largely based on new institutional theory. She has published several edited volumes, books, and articles. She is currently Chair of the research program WASP-HS (The Wallenberg AI, Autonomous Systems and Software Program – Humanities and Society).

Ulla Eriksson-Zetterquist, since 2010, has been Professor in Organization Theory and Management at the Gothenburg Research Institute (GRI), and at the Department for Business Administration, School of Business, Economics, and Law, University of Gothenburg. She has been Visiting Scholar at SCANCOR Stanford (Spring 2010), SCANCOR Harvard (Fall 2016), and Visiting Professor at Uppsala University in 2013. Between 2012 and 2023 she served as the Director of GRI. During 2014 and 2015, she was the Chair of the Swedish Academy of Business and Management. She has been active as Associated Editor for the journal *Gender, Work and Organization* between the years of 2004 and 2020. Since 2017, she is heading the research program *Managing Digital Transformations*. Her research interests concern organizing, governance in professional organizations, diversity and inclusion, and digitalization. These themes have been explored in a variety of organizations, both in private and public sectors, for instance, in multinational corporations, the automotive industry, the public school, and the Swedish Defense Authority. She has published in the field of organization theory and management studies, including journal articles, research monographs, and textbooks. She edited her latest book with Magnus Hansson and Fredrik Nilsson (2020): *Theories and Perspectives in Swedish Business Administration Studies*.

This page intentionally left blank

ABOUT THE CONTRIBUTORS

Nico Cloete is Professor at the Centre for Research on Evaluation, Science and Technology (CREST), Stellenbosch University. He is the Former Director of the Centre for Higher Education Trust (CHET) and a Guest Professor at the University of Oslo.

Nancy Côté is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Sociology at Université Laval, FRQS Research Scholar and member of VITAM, a sustainable health research center in Québec, Canada. Her work is at the crossroads of sociology of work, professions, and organizations.

Logan Crace is a PhD student in the Strategy, Entrepreneurship, and Management Department at the University of Alberta. His current research uses organization theory to explore what enables and obstructs change efforts, with a particular emphasis on grand challenges and sustainability.

Rick Delbridge is Professor of Organizational Analysis at Cardiff Business School and Co-convenor of the Centre for Innovation Policy Research, Cardiff University. He has received best paper awards from *Academy of Management Review* and *Organization Studies* and been elected as a Fellow of the Academy of Social Sciences, the British Academy of Management, and the Learned Society of Wales.

Jean-Louis Denis is Professor in Health Policy and Management at the School of Public Health, Université de Montréal – CRCHUM-CRDP. He holds the Canada Research Chair on design and adaptation of health systems. His research program is located at the intersection of applied health services research, organizational studies, and policy research.

Gili S. Drori is Professor of Sociology and Anthropology and currently Dean of the Faculty of Social Sciences at The Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel. She earned her academic education at Tel Aviv University (BA in 1986 and MA in 1989) and Stanford University (PhD in 1997 in Sociology).

Ulla Eriksson-Zetterquist is Professor in Organization Theory and Management at the Gothenburg Research Institute (GRI), and at the Department for Business Administration, School of Business, Economics, and Law, University of Gothenburg. She has been Visiting Scholar at SCANCOR Stanford, SCANCOR Harvard, and Visiting Professor at Uppsala University. Her research interests concern organizing, governance in professional organizations, diversity and

inclusion, and digitalization. These themes have been explored in a variety of organizations, both in private and public sectors, for instance in multinational corporations, the automotive industry, the public school, and the Swedish Defense Authority.

Joel Gehman is a Professor of Strategic Management and Public Policy and Lindner-Gambal Professor of Business Ethics at George Washington University. His research examines strategic, technological, and institutional responses to grand challenges related to sustainability and values concerns. He earned a PhD in Management and Organization from Pennsylvania State University.

Lisa-Maria Gerhardt is a Research Associate and doctoral candidate at the Chair of Organization, Leadership and Human Resource Management at Friedrich Schiller University Jena, Germany. Her research interests include institutional theories, organizations, and higher education.

Jan Goldenstein is a Research Associate at Friedrich Schiller University Jena, Germany. His research interests include institutional theory, category research, social evaluation, market entry decisions, comparative international studies, and methodological research. He has published in journals such as *Journal of Business Venturing*, *Journal of Management Studies*, and *Sociological Methodology*.

Hampus Östh Gustafsson (PhD) is a Researcher at the Department of History of Science and Ideas, Uppsala University. His research is focused on the history of the humanities and universities, and the formation of modern politics of knowledge. His recent publications include articles in journals such as *History of Humanities* and *History of Education Review*.

Audrey Harroche is a sociologist who works on the implementation of policies for excellence in the academic sector, focusing on questions regarding the production of knowledge and inequalities. She is a lecturer at Oxford Brookes University and is also affiliated with the CSO at Sciences Po.

Maggie Hébert is a Master's student in the Department of Sociology at Université Laval. Her research focuses on academic freedom and governance in Canadian universities.

Jakov Jandrić is the Nick Oliver Lecturer in Organisational Behaviour at the University of Edinburgh Business School. His research interests include age and aging in the workplace, and the exploration of the changing landscape of higher education and its implications for institutions, academics, and students.

Anna Kosmützky is a Sociologist and Professor for the "Methodology of Higher Education and Science Research" at the Leibniz Center of Science and Society (LCSS), Leibniz University Hannover. Her research interests are in the areas of higher education research, science studies, and organization studies with a focus

on methodological issues, globalization of higher education, and organizational and institutional change of universities.

Georg Krücken is Professor of the Sociology of Higher Education and Director of the International Center for Higher Education Research (INCHER), both at the University of Kassel, Germany. He is one of the spokespersons of the research network “New Institutionalism” and a member of *Academia Europaea*. His research interests include higher education research, science studies, organization studies, and neo-institutional theory.

Seungah S. Lee is a Senior Lecturer of Social Research and Public Policy at New York University Abu Dhabi. Her research is primarily concerned with how nation-states and organizations adapt and contextualize global models and scripts around development, innovation, and entrepreneurship toward social, cultural, and educational change. She holds a PhD in Organization Studies and International Comparative Education from Stanford University.

Michael Lounsbury is a Professor and A.F (Chip) Collins Chair in the Strategy, Entrepreneurship and Management Department at the University of Alberta School of Business, where he is also the Academic Director of the eHUB Entrepreneurship Centre. He is the Series Editor of *Research in the Sociology of Organizations* and has previously served as Chair of the Organization and Management Theory Division of the Academy of Management. His PhD is in Sociology and Organization Behavior from Northwestern University.

Ravit Mizrahi-Shtelman is a Lecturer at the Faculty of Education at the Kibbutzim College. She earned her doctoral degree in Sociology from the Hebrew University of Jerusalem and went on to complete post-doctoral studies at Stanford University. Her research interests are wide ranging and include the study of educational organizations, higher education, globalization and glocalization, identity, and leadership.

Christine Musselin is a Researcher at the Centre for the Sociology of Organizations (CSO), a Sciences Po and CNRS research unit. She leads comparative studies on university governance, higher education policies, and academic labor markets. She has led the CSO from 2007 to 2013 and has been the Vice-President for Research of Sciences Po from 2013 to 2018.

Pedro Pineda (Dr. Phil., Humboldt University of Berlin) is Associate Professor (Senior Lecturer) at the Department of Education, University of Bath. He specializes in the fields of comparative education, higher education, the sociology of education, and organizational studies.

Paolo Quattrone is Professor of Accounting, Governance and Society at the Alliance Manchester Business School where he also leads the Centre for the Analysis of Investment Risk. Before joining AMBS, he has held chairs at the University of

Edinburgh Business School and IE Business School, Madrid, and was Reader in Accounting at Saïd Business School, and official student (fellow) of Christ Church. He is the co-Editor-in-Chief of *Organization Studies*.

Francisco O. Ramirez is the Vida Jacks Professor of Education and (by courtesy) Sociology at Stanford University. His current research interests focus on the worldwide rationalization of university structures and processes, in terms of inclusion issues as regards gender and education, and on challenges to globalization. His recent publications may be found in *Sociology of Education*, *Comparative Education Review*, *Social Forces*, and *International Sociology*. He has been a fellow at the Center for the Advanced Studies of the Behavioral Sciences (2006–2007), the Swedish Collegium for Advanced Studies (2017), and the Free University of Berlin, Cluster of Excellence Contestations of the Liberal Script (2022). He has been inducted into the honor societies of the American Sociological Association and the Comparative and International Education Society. His research has been supported by grants from the National Science Foundation, the Spencer Foundation, and the Stanford Institute for International Studies.

Kerstin Sahlin is Professor of Public Management in the Department of Business Studies at Uppsala University. Her major research interests include decision-making on complex projects, the expansion and translation of management ideas, organizational reforms of public sector, transnational regulation, and more recently university governance and collegiality. She has been Vice president of the Royal Swedish Academy of Sciences, Secretary General of Humanities and Social Sciences at the Swedish Research Council, and Deputy Vice-Chancellor of Uppsala University.

François van Schalkwyk is a Post-doctoral Research Fellow at the Centre for Research on Evaluation, Science and Technology (CREST), Stellenbosch University.

Peter Walgenbach is Professor of Organization, Leadership and HRM at Friedrich Schiller University Jena, Germany. He currently serves as a Senior Editor of *Organization Studies*. He has published widely in various fields and journals in management and organization studies.

FOREWORD

Research in the Sociology of Organizations (RSO) publishes cutting-edge empirical research and theoretical papers that seek to enhance our understanding of organizations and organizing as pervasive and fundamental aspects of society and economy. We seek provocative papers that push the frontiers of current conversations, that help to revive old ones, or that incubate and develop new perspectives. Given its successes in this regard, *RSO* has become an impactful and indispensable fount of knowledge for scholars interested in organizational phenomena and theories. *RSO* is indexed and ranks highly in Scopus/SCImago as well as in the Academic Journal Guide published by the Chartered Association of Business schools.

As one of the most vibrant areas in the social sciences, the sociology of organizations engages a plurality of empirical and theoretical approaches to enhance our understanding of the varied imperatives and challenges that these organizations and their organizers face. Of course, there is a diversity of formal and informal organizations – from for-profit entities to non-profits, state and public agencies, social enterprises, communal forms of organizing, non-governmental associations, trade associations, publicly traded, family owned and managed, private firms – the list goes on! Organizations, moreover, can vary dramatically in size from small entrepreneurial ventures to large multi-national conglomerates to international governing bodies such as the United Nations.

Empirical topics addressed by *RSO* include the formation, survival, and growth of organizations; collaboration and competition between organizations; the accumulation and management of resources and legitimacy; and how organizations or organizing efforts cope with a multitude of internal and external challenges and pressures. Particular interest is growing in the complexities of contemporary organizations as they cope with changing social expectations and as they seek to address societal problems related to corporate social responsibility, inequality, corruption and wrongdoing, and the challenge of new technologies. As a result, levels of analysis reach from the individual to the organization, industry, community and field, and even the nation-state or world society. Much research is multi-level and embraces both qualitative and quantitative forms of data.

Diverse theory is employed or constructed to enhance our understanding of these topics. While anchored in the discipline of sociology and the field of management, *RSO* also welcomes theoretical engagement that draws on other disciplinary conversations – such as those in political science or economics, as well as work from diverse philosophical traditions. *RSO* scholarship has helped push forward a plethora of theoretical conversations on institutions and institutional change, networks, practice, culture, power, inequality, social movements,

categories, routines, organization design and change, configurational dynamics, and many other topics.

Each volume of *RSO* tends to be thematically focused on a particular empirical phenomenon (e.g., creative industries, multinational corporations, and entrepreneurship) or theoretical conversation (e.g., institutional logics, actors and agency, and microfoundations). The series publishes papers by junior as well as leading international scholars, and embraces diversity in all dimensions. If you are a scholar interested in organizations or organizing, I hope you find *RSO* to be an invaluable resource as you develop your work.

Professor Michael Lounsbury
Series Editor, *Research in the Sociology of Organizations*
Canada Research Chair in Entrepreneurship & Innovation
University of Alberta