



---

**MARKETISATION AND  
FORENSIC SCIENCE  
PROVISION  
IN ENGLAND AND WALES**

---

**KAREN MCGREGOR RICHMOND**

# **Marketisation and Forensic Science Provision in England and Wales**

*This page intentionally left blank*

# Marketisation and Forensic Science Provision in England and Wales

BY

**KAREN MCGREGOR RICHMOND**

*University of Copenhagen, Denmark*



United Kingdom – North America – Japan – India – Malaysia – China

Emerald Publishing Limited  
Howard House, Wagon Lane, Bingley BD16 1WA, UK

First edition 2023

Copyright © 2023 Karen McGregor Richmond.  
Published under exclusive licence by Emerald Publishing Limited.

**Reprints and permissions service**

Contact: [permissions@emeraldinsight.com](mailto:permissions@emeraldinsight.com)

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, transmitted in any form or by any means electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without either the prior written permission of the publisher or a licence permitting restricted copying issued in the UK by The Copyright Licensing Agency and in the USA by The Copyright Clearance Center. Any opinions expressed in the chapters are those of the authors. Whilst Emerald makes every effort to ensure the quality and accuracy of its content, Emerald makes no representation implied or otherwise, as to the chapters' suitability and application and disclaims any warranties, express or implied, to their use.

**British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data**

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN: 978-1-83909-124-7 (Print)

ISBN: 978-1-83909-123-0 (Online)

ISBN: 978-1-83909-125-4 (Epub)



ISOQAR certified  
Management System,  
awarded to Emerald  
for adherence to  
Environmental  
standard  
ISO 14001:2004.

Certificate Number 1985  
ISO 14001



INVESTOR IN PEOPLE

*This work is dedicated to my father, Gordon Black Richmond.*

*This page intentionally left blank*

# Contents

List of Abbreviations	<i>xi</i>
Preface and Acknowledgements	<i>xii</i>
<b>Chapter 1 The Forensic Market</b>	<b>1</b>
Introduction	1
Forensic Science Provision in England and Wales	3
Marketisation and Privatisation in England and Wales	4
Forensic Science Marketisation and Privatisation	5
Forensic Science Provision in Northern Ireland	8
Police Force Forensic Science Provision in the UK	12
<b>Chapter 2 Forensic-Scientific Processes</b>	<b>17</b>
DNA and Epistemological Privilege	17
Probability and Statistical Evidence in Criminal Proceedings	21
Standardisation through Probabilistic Evidence Techniques	22
The CAI Method	27
<b>Chapter 3 Exploring the Forensic Field</b>	<b>33</b>
Methods	34
Science and Technology Studies (STS) and Forensic-Scientific Knowledge	40
STS and Studies of Expertise and Experience (SEE)	47
The Common Origins of Law and Science	48
Auopoesis and the Systems Theory of Interdisciplinary Knowledge	51

<b>Chapter 4 The Commodification of Forensic Science</b>	<b>53</b>
Chapter Summary	53
Introduction	54
Forensic Science Provision in England and Wales	55
Economic Rationalisation in the UK	56
The FSS: Transition and Closure	56
Restructuring and DNA Analysis	57
The Forensic Science Market	60
Procurement and the National Forensic Framework	
Agreement (NFFA)	61
The National Policing Improvement Agency (NPIA)/NFFA	64
Forensic Productisation – Implementation and Resistance	64
Triaging of Forensic Investigations	67
Conclusion	70
<b>Chapter 5 Constructing Forensic Expertise</b>	<b>73</b>
Chapter Summary	73
Pre-codification Forensic Analyses within the Public Sector	74
Triaging and the Privileging of DNA-profiling Techniques	75
Case Fragmentation and Quoting	78
Mixtures and Low-Template DNA	80
Commercialisation and the Restructuring of Forensic	
Expertise	83
Triaging and Forensic Science Provision in the Public Sector	88
The Contest and Communication Narrative – Silos and	
Transfer of Expertise	96
Interdisciplinary Theories of Expertise	97
<b>Chapter 6 Swift and Sure Justice?</b>	<b>103</b>
Chapter Summary	103
SFR and Abbreviated (or ‘Staged’) Forensic Reporting	104
Background: The Ministry of Justice (MoJ) Efficiency	
Programme	106
CrimPR	108
Supporting Case Law	109
SFR – Outline	110
Lawfulness of SFR Under the European Union (EU)	
Directives	125
Conclusion	128

<b>Chapter 7 Objectivity – ‘The View from Nowhere’</b>	<b>129</b>
Chapter Summary	129
The Forensic Science Regulator (FSR)	130
FSR’s Regulatory Responsibilities: International Standards	131
Accreditation	131
Professional and Commercial Standards	132
Forensics Procurement Framework	132
Forensic Regulator’s Code of Practice and Conduct and Investigation of Complaints	132
Quality Assurance and <i>Daubert</i> Criteria	133
Regulation and the ‘Enhanced <i>Daubert</i> ’ Criteria	136
Accreditation and DNA Profiling	137
DNA Profiling and the Declaration of ‘Non-compliance’	137
Regulatory Objectivity	139
The Normative Basis of Forensic Science	145
<b>Chapter 8 From Biological Substrate to Digital Analyte</b>	<b>147</b>
Chapter Summary	147
Research Challenges: DNA Mixtures, Transfer, and Persistence	148
DNA Mixtures, Transfer, and Persistence	149
Summary of Conclusions	154
Standardisation	155
Expertise	156
Efficiency	157
Regulation and Autonomy	158
Contribution of this Study to the Literature	160
From Biological Substrate Towards Digital Analyte	160
<b>References</b>	<b>163</b>
Government Reports and Regulatory Guidance	164
Legislation and Cases	164
<b>Index</b>	<b>165</b>

*This page intentionally left blank*

# List of Abbreviations

CAI	Case Assessment and Interpretation
CJINI	Criminal Justice Inspectorate Northern Ireland
CJS	Criminal Justice System
DNA	Deoxyribonucleic Acid
EGPS	Early Guilty Plea Scheme
ERU	Evidence Recovery Unit
FSNI	Forensic Science Northern Ireland
FSP	Forensic Science Provider
FSR	Forensic Science Regulator
FSS	Forensic Science Service
LCN-DNA	Low Copy Number DNA
NDNAD	National DNA Database
NIDNAD	Northern Ireland DNA Database
PSNI	Police Service of Northern Ireland
RMP	Random Match Probability
SFR	Streamlined Forensic Reporting

# Preface and Acknowledgements

The boundaries between this book and my ongoing research are not so rigidly demarcated that I can easily list those to whom I owe thanks. It would not have been possible without the engagement of staff at Edinburgh, Strathclyde, and Dundee, universities in Scotland, and research projects within the Leverhulme Research Centre for Forensic Sciences, Technical University Graz, and my current institution, iCourts (the Danish National Research Foundation's Centre of Excellence in International Courts, University of Copenhagen). I am grateful for their encouragement.

Special thanks, however, are due to Dame Professor Sue Black, Vice Chancellor at Lancaster University and Senior Member of the Royal Society of Edinburgh, for setting me on the right track; to Professor Nicolette Priaux of Cardiff University for her continued inspiration; and to Professor Mikkel Jarle Christensen of University of Copenhagen, for opening new doors.

For their enduring interest, and enthusiastic participation in my research, I am grateful to: the Royal Society, the Royal Society of Edinburgh, Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Constabulary, the United Kingdom Accreditation Service, the Crown Prosecution Service, the Metropolitan Police, and the Office for the Forensic Regulator. Thanks also to the Scottish Police Authority, Scottish Institute for Policing Research, and the Faculty of Advocates. Greatest thanks are due to the staff of the forensic science providers in all four corners of the UK for sharing so freely of their time and expert knowledge.

I am likewise grateful to fellow doctoral students, researchers, and academics for the encouragement and engagement they offered, having enlisted their help in reading – and commenting on – early drafts and research papers. Thanks also to the Institute for Advanced Legal Studies, the Law and Society Association, the Socio-Legal Studies Association, the Chartered Society of Forensic Sciences, and the Society of Legal Scholars, for helping me to disseminate my research. And I owe a special debt to all those who took an interest in this project and who attended workshops and conferences to hear me speak about the results of my research.

The greatest thanks must go to my father, Gordon Black Richmond, who passed away before this book could be published, but who never doubted my potential, and whose hard work, resilience, and faith continue to inspire me. This work is dedicated to him.