# Mixed-Income Housing Development Planning Strategies and Frameworks in the Global South

This page intentionally left blank

# Mixed-Income Housing Development Planning Strategies and Frameworks in the Global South

BY

#### GEORGE OKECHUKWU ONATU

University of Johannesburg, South Africa

#### WELLINGTON DIDIBHUKU THWALA

Walter Sisulu Univesity, South Africa

AND

### **CLINTON OHIS AIGBAVBOA**

University of Johannesburg, South Africa



Emerald Publishing Limited Emerald Publishing, Floor 5, Northspring, 21-23 Wellington Street, Leeds LS1 4DL

First edition 2024

Copyright © 2024 George Okechukwu Onatu, Wellington Didibhuku Thwala, and Clinton Ohis Aighayboa

Published under an exclusive license by Emerald Publishing Limited.

#### Reprints and permissions service

Contact: www.copyright.com

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, transmitted in any form or by any means electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without either the prior written permission of the publisher or a licence permitting restricted copying issued in the UK by The Copyright Licensing Agency and in the USA by The Copyright Clearance Center. Any opinions expressed in the chapters are those of the authors. Whilst Emerald makes every effort to ensure the quality and accuracy of its content, Emerald makes no representation implied or otherwise, as to the chapters' suitability and application and disclaims any warranties, express or implied, to their use.

#### British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN: 978-1-83753-815-7 (Print) ISBN: 978-1-83753-814-0 (Online) ISBN: 978-1-83753-816-4 (Epub)





This page intentionally left blank

# **Table of Contents**

List of Fig	ures	ix
List of Tables		xi
List of Abbreviations		xiii
About the	Authors	xv
Foreword		xvii
Preface		xix
Acknowled	gement	xxi
Chapter 1	Introduction and Background	1
Chapter 2	Meaning, Goals and Implications of Mixed-Income Housing Development	9
Chapter 3	Mixed-Income Housing Development Research Theories and Concepts	25
Chapter 4	Philosophical Perspectives Guiding Housing Research	41
Chapter 5	Mixed-Income Housing Development in Developed Nations	51
Chapter 6	Mixed-Income Housing Development Model in Developing Nations	71
Chapter 7	South African Housing Policy and Legislative Framework	87

## viii Table of Contents

Chapter 8	The Use of Delphi Study in Mixed-Income Housing Development	101
Chapter 9	Case Study Area, Cosmo City Johannesburg	131
Chapter 10	Mixed-Income Housing Development Framework for South Africa and Global South	141
Chapter 11	Outcome of the Mixed-Income Housing Development Framework Findings and Results	165
Appendices		183
References		223
Index		249

# **List of Figures**

Chapter 8		
Fig. 8.1.	Mixed-income Housing Development to Enhance and Promote Integrated Human Settlements.	e 115
Fig. 8.2.	The Need for Strong and Good Intergovernmental Relationship and Coordination.	117
Fig. 8.3.	Public–Private Partnership.	118
Fig. 8.4.	Provide the Frequency of the Impact of Leadership From Government on Mixed-income Housing.	119
Fig. 8.5.	Present the Result of This Finding of Access to Finance.	120
Fig. 8.6.	Town Planning Approvals and Processing.	121
Fig. 8.7.	Mixed-income to Broaden Affordability in Housing.	122
Fig. 8.8.	Factors at Three Spheres of Government.	122
Fig. 8.9.	The Problem of Informal Settlements.	123
Fig. 8.10.	Eradication of Informal Settlements.	124
Fig. 8.11.	Good Place to Live, Work and Play.	125
Fig. 8.12.	Lack of Bulk Infrastructure.	125
Fig. 8.13.	Capacity Challenges at Government and Municipal Levels.	126
Fig. 8.14.	Shift From Subsidy Housing Programme.	127
Fig. 8.15.	Mixed-income Housing Result to Strong Community as well as Correct Previous Apartheid Spatial Planning and Settlement	
	Pattern.	128

## x List of Figures

Fig. 8.16.	Shift to Mixed-income Housing in 9–10 Years.	129
Chapter 10		
Fig. 10.1.	Picture of Cosmo City Primary School.	144
Fig. 10.2.	Cornubia With Limited Social Amenities.	147
Fig. 10.3.	Mixed-Income Housing Delivery Framework.	153

# **List of Tables**

Chapter 8		
Table 8.1.	Response Rate to the Questionnaire.	104
Table 8.2.	Round One Qualitative Data.	106
Table 8.3.	Round Two Mean and Standard Deviation.	112
Table 8.4.	The Mean and Standard Deviation of Round Three.	114
Chapter 10		
Table 10.1.	Items for the Nearness to Social Services Construct.	144
Table 10.2.	Items for the Community Involvement and Participation Construct.	146
Table 10.3.	Items for the Town Planning Approval and Policy Construct.	148
Table 10.4.	Items for the Occupation Social Interaction Construct.	149
Table 10.5.	Items for the Access to Housing and Affordability Construct.	151
Table 10.6.	Items for the Intergovernmental Support and Collaboration Construct.	152
Table 10.7.	Overall Expanded MIHD Framework.	154
Table 10.8.	Nearness to Social Services (NSS).	155
Table 10.9.	Community Involvement and Participation (CI).	156
Table 10.10.	Town Planning Approval and Policy (TRAP).	158
Table 10.11.	Occupant Social Interaction (OSI).	159
Table 10.12.	Access to Housing and Affordability (AFA).	160
Table 10.13.	Intergovernmental Support and Collaboration (IGSC).	161

## xii List of Tables

Table 10.14.	Equation Level Goodness of Fit.	162
Chapter 11		
Table 11.1.	Rotated Factor Matrix – Nearness to Social Services.	171
Table 11.2.	Rotated Factor Matrix – Community Involvement and Participation (CIP).	172
Table 11.3.	Rotated Factor Matrix – Town Planning Approval and Policy (TPAP).	174
Table 11.4.	Rotated Factor Matrix – Occupant Social Interaction (OSI).	175
Table 11.5.	Rotated Factor Matrix – Access to Housing and Affordability (AFA).	177
Table 11.6.	Rotated Factor Matrix – Intergovernmental Support and Collaboration (IGSC).	178

## **List of Abbreviations**

AMI Average Medium Income
ANC African National Congress

APNHR Asia-Pacific Network for Housing Research

BNG Breaking New Ground

CBO Community-Based Organization

CCPR California Centre for Population Research

CIA Central Intelligence Agency
CLL Common Law Leasehold

CoGTA Department of Cooperative Governance & Traditional

Affairs

CoR Certificate of Right

COSATU Congress for South African Trade Unions

CPF Central Provident Fund

CSHA Commonwealth State Housing Agency

CSIR Council for Scientific and Industrial Research

DA Democratic Alliance

DFI Direct Foreign Investment

DPME Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation DRDLR Department of Rural Development & Land Reforms

FHA Federal Housing Authority

FELDA Federal Land Development Authority

ELCRA Federal Land Consolidation and Rehabilitation

Authority

FMBN Federal Mortgage Bank of Nigeria

FPSG Fixed Period State Grant
GDP Gross Domestic Product
GRA Government Reserve Areas
HDB Housing Development Board

#### xiv List of Abbreviations

HOPE Housing Opportunities for Everyone
HUD Housing and Urban Development

ICESCO International Convention on Economic, Social and

Cultural Rights

IMF International Monetary Fund

IRDP Integrated Rural Development Programme
IUDF Integrated Urban Development Framework

LAP Land Administration Project
LITC Low Income Tax Credit

MIRG Mixed-Income Research Group

NAHA National Affordable Housing Programme

NEP National Economic Policies NIMBY Not In My Back Yard

NNHP New National Housing Policy

NUSP National Upgrading Support Programme

PIE Prevention of Illegal Eviction SACN South Africa Cities Network

SERI Socio-Economic Research Institute

SHHA Self-Help Housing Agency

SPLUMA Spatial Planning and Land Use Management

TND Traditional Neighbourhood Design

TPC Town Planning Complaint

UN The United Nations

UNDP United Nations Development Agency
VPADD Voluntary Pro-Active Deal Driven

### **About the Authors**

Dr George Okechukwu Onatu is a Staff and Senior Lecturer in the Department of Urban and Regional Planning, University of Johannesburg, South Africa. He completed his PhD in Engineering Management (Housing) at the University of Johannesburg in 2021. He was the former Head of Department from 2010 to 2016. His research interest lies in human settlements, informality, Spatial Planning, land use management, urban planning, housing provisions and property development as well as the Fourth Industrial Revolution and mix-use development. Some of his research works has been extensively published in recognized Journals and conference proceedings. He is a member of various bodies, including the editorial board of the Town and Regional Planning Journal South Africa and also support and assist in scholarly debates as a board member of the Association of African Planning Schools (AAPS). Dr Onatu is the author of over 40 published research articles in both local and international conference proceedings. He also assisted both the National Department of Human Settlements South Africa and National Homebuilders Registration Council (NHBRC) as a research consultant and policy expert specialist on housing issues.

Wellington Didibhuku Thwala is a Full Professor of Construction Project Management and Leadership at the Department of Construction Management and Civil Engineering at the Walter Sisulu University. He is a Director of the DST NRF SARCHI Chair in Sustainable Construction Management and Leadership in the Built Environment. He is the Chairman of the Construction Management Foundation Advisory Board. Professor Thwala has varied research interest, including project management, construction management, supply chain management and leadership in the construction industry, health and safety, engineering design and management, 4IR, infrastructure delivery, business competitiveness and sustainable housing and local economic development. He is the Editor in Chief of the Journal of Construction Project Management and Innovation, Peer Reviewer of Built Environment Project and Asset Management, as well as Journal of Facility Management and has more than 1,700 citations and 490 publications.

**Clinton Ohis Aigbavboa** is a Full Professor at the Department of Construction Management and Quantity Surveying, University of Johannesburg, South Africa. Prof. Aigbavboa is the immediate past Vice Dean of the Faculty of Engineering and Built Environment, University of Johannesburg, South Africa. He has extensive knowledge in practice, research, training and teaching. He is currently

#### xvi About the Authors

the Director of the Construction Industry Development Board Centre of Excellence and the Sustainable Human Settlement and Construction Research Centre at the University of Johannesburg. He is also an author of 12 research books that were published with Springer Nature and CRC Press. He is currently the Editor of the Journal of Construction Project Management and Innovation (accredited by the DoHET) and has received national and international recognition in his field of research. He is rated by the South Africa National Research Foundation.

### **Foreword**

It is a honour and privilege to be requested to write this foreword to this remarkable book on Mixed-Income Housing Development Planning Strategies and Frameworks in the Global South. With over 35 dedicated years of experience in teaching, conducting research and supervision of students of Urban and Regional Planning, I feel as the best person in a position to do justice to this request. Moreover, as the former Deputy Vice Chancellor of one of the Premier Universities in the continent, University of Nigeria, Nsukka, where I was instrumental in attracting many projects and organizing so many seminars and conferences which brought the University to visibility and to be ranked very high among the Universities in Nigeria. More also as one of the pioneering members of the Association of African Planning Schools (AAPS) and a member of the seven-man steering committee, the continental network comprising of 54 Universities where I met one of the authors in 2010, it gives me additional fulfilment to write about this important resource book on human settlements. Dr George O. Onatu is a seasoned scholar/Urban and Regional Planner as well as housing specialist who was instrumental in the growth and development of the Department of Urban and Regional Planning at the University of Johannesburg. He served as the Head of Department for two tenures. Prof C. Aigbavboa served as the Vice Dean Research and Internationalization of the Faculty of Engineering and Built Environment, University of Johannesburg with several other awards and is the Executive Director of Centre for Industrial Development Board (CIDB) and sustainable human settlements and construction management research. Prof D. W. Thwala is an NRF, DST and SARCHI Chair as well as top researcher for several periods with more than 25 years of teaching and research experience, with so many citations and Senior Fellow at a Centre and the Department of Civil Engineering, College of Engineering Science and Technology at the University of South Africa (UNISA). With this profile and diverse experiences of these scholars, they are all well grounded with multidisciplinary knowledge/skills to come up with this important resource book to showcase their valued contributions to the practice, teaching and research on housing.

Mixed-income housing development and implementations strategies are increasingly becoming one area of human settlements research that is gaining increasing attention and attractions. With the world population expected to reach an astronomical 9.8 billion by 2050 from the current 7.6 billion, informed by the addition of 83 million people every year on the planet, most governments and international organizations are facing considerable challenges as it relates to

#### xviii Foreword

access to housing by these teaming population, exacerbated urban poverty and hunger, as well as environmental conservation and climate change issues. We cannot continue to fold our hands and stare. Hence, this book is recommended for all those who are interested in ensuring that the world moves forward with speed to cater for these rising population as it relates to shelter and necessary condition to attain sustainable human settlements. The framework so developed in the book is user friendly and will argue all current efforts, publications and policy gaps which need urgent solution on a global scale. The case examples drawn from both the developed and developing countries will serve as a sign post and road map to urban planners, construction economics, developers, researchers, community leaders, social scientists, private sector and all stakeholders as well as built environment students/engineering specialists/practitioners on how to approach the problems confronting human settlements and design strategies. You cannot wait further than to read this book that has come handy at this important period in the history of human race and associated challenges that at times resist solutions and appear not solvable. These problems are now noted and associated with hidden opportunities that are not so visible and are at times overlooked.

Yours sincerely,

Prof. Smart N. Uchegbu, PhD, MSc, BA, fnitp, fnes, meman, Rtp Deputy Vice Chancellor Emeritus University of Nigeria, Nsukka

### **Preface**

The twenty-first century is noted globally as the urban century of unique character, dynamism, symbiosis and complexities because more than half of the world's population lives in cities. This population is projected to increase to 70% by 2050. South Africa is no exception to this phenomenal increase in urban population. More than 60% of South African population lives in urban areas, and this figure is projected to increase to 71.3% and 80% by 2030 and 2050, respectively. Access to human settlement by this teaming population remains a challenge/issue and undoubting task to the incumbent government and previous regimes. The problem of access to human settlements is compounded by historical apartheid's spatial geography characterized by racial segregation, fragmentation of urban space and separate development. During the apartheid period, settlement patterns were designed and planned in accordance with racial differentiation. This resulted to fragmented and dysfunctional residential settlements pattern that forced many people to travel long distances between place of work and home. Since 1994, the various housing policies, programmes and legislation have not been able to find solution to the spatial challenges that South Africa faces. The objective of this book is to investigate and unpack mixed-income housing development strategy and how this housing typology with a new framework can bring about spatial integration, improved access to social services, infrastructure and the promotion of social and economic inclusion. The research utilized the case study research design and employed the Delphi method for the investigation. It provides a step-by-step guide on how to use Delphi technique and Structural Equation Modelling (SEM) in human settlements research and planning. The findings reveal that proper coordination across all sectors of government and good working relationship between the private and public sectors will increase the sustainability of mixed-income housing development. This book for the first time brings together and synthesize the relevant theories and concepts that guide mixed-income housing development and human settlements in general. This book is also a reach out to support existing theories that mixed-income housing might not be able to bring about overall social integration, solve all housing problems, but it has the unique tendency, character and peculiarity in the South African case to address spatial imbalances by increasing the affordability of low-cost housing. This research book will provide important resource toolkit as it concludes that there is need for both inter-sectoral and intergovernmental collaboration as well

#### xx Preface

as proper coordination/adequate urban planning to address the human settlement challenges in South Africa and for effective implementation of mixed-income housing development in both developed and developing economies. The use of case studies from the United States, Australia, the Netherlands, Brazil, Nigeria, Botswana and Ghana is noteworthy and serve as an important selling point.

## **Acknowledgement**

We sincerely appreciate the contributions and cooperation of our colleagues at the Faculty of Engineering and the Built Environment, the Department of Urban and Regional Planning and the Department of Construction Management and Quantity Surveying. In this vein, we say thank you to Prof Daniel Mashao, Prof Morgan Dundu, Prof Charles Mbohwa, Prof Steven Ekolu, Prof Jeffrey Mahachi, Mr Zenzile Mbinza, Mr Aurobindo Ogra, Prof Trynos Gumbo, Prof Walter Musakwa, Dr Eric Makoni, Mr Jude Okafor, Ms Natasha Ntakana, Ms Sithembile Thusi, Adv Petrus Steyn, Dr Justice Agumba, Prof Innocent Musonda, Mr Nazeem Ansary, Mrs Mogodi, Mrs Corlia Jordan and Mrs N Mzobe. Our mutual sharing and working relationship over the years have not gone unnoticed. Finally, we would like to thank the following: the staff of Basil Reeds; Urban Dynamics Pty Ltd, the National Department of Human Settlements; the City of Johannesburg Metropolitan Municipality; Iver Development Consultants, for their contributions to this book; our Statisticians, Mr Serge Malandala and Mr Elvis Ganyaupfu for data analysis. We also acknowledge the research work of Urban Institute in the United States on Mixed-Income Housing that also assisted us in building our argument. We are also very grateful to Africa Sustainability Infrastructure Mobility (ASIM) project of 2023 and Ardhi University, Dar Es Salaam, Tanzania where one of our colleagues spent time through staff exchange to finally conclude this book. Our sincere hope is that this book will serve these communities and the countries of global south and beyond.