# Policy Solutions for Economic Growth in a Developing Country

First of its kind, comprehensive and illuminating insight into Afghanistan with concrete recommendations on how the country can thrive and help itself reform its trade and trade relations with the world.

—Dr Ahmad Khalid Hatam, Chancellor, Kardan University, Kabul, Afghanistan

Immersing myself in the pages of this book, I journeyed through the world of Afghanistan's global trade, concluding with enriched insights essential for academics and policymakers.

—Dr Behnaz Saboori,
Assistant Professor,
College of Agricultural and Marine Sciences,
Sultan Qaboos University, Muscat, Oman

I highly recommend this book for its in-depth exploration of Afghanistan's international trade journey, especially post-2001. It provides valuable insights for policymakers and scholars, offering innovative trade proposals and insights into Afghanistan's global trade role. Essential for understanding Afghanistan's trade potential.

—Dr Lyla Abdul Latif, Chair and Research Lead, Committee on Fiscal Studies, University of Nairobi

This book provides a timely and profoundly insightful exploration into a fundamental question that has bedevilled economic policy planning for decades – how should developing countries achieve economic growth? Straddling the topics of international trade, globalisation, economic development, state policy planning and private sector development, Wani diagnoses the impediments to export-oriented growth and proposes ambitious recommendations that may serve as correctives. His focus on Afghanistan provides a rich site for exploring these challenges. Using extensive quantitative analysis alongside well-established theoretical models, Wani positions Afghanistan vis-à-vis its regional neighbours as well as concerning ASEAN and SAARC nations and the European Union, thereby evincing opportunities for enhanced international trade. While optimistic, he also raises the trade-offs of different policy choices. The book draws on Wani's decade of scholarly engagement with Afghanistan's economy, ultimately succeeding in providing lessons on economic growth that may be applied to much of the developing world.

—Dr Nafay Choudhury, London School of Economics and Political Science

# Policy Solutions for Economic Growth in a Developing Country: Perspectives on Afghanistan's Trade and Development

BY

NASSIR UL HAQ WANI

Kardan University, Afghanistan



Emerald Publishing Limited Emerald Publishing, Floor 5, Northspring, 21-23 Wellington Street, Leeds LS1 4DL

First edition 2024

Copyright © 2024 Nassir Ul Haq Wani. Published under exclusive licence by Emerald Publishing Limited.

#### Reprints and permissions service

Contact: www.copyright.com

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, transmitted in any form or by any means electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without either the prior written permission of the publisher or a licence permitting restricted copying issued in the United Kingdom by the Copyright Licensing Agency and in the United States by the Copyright Clearance Center. Any opinions expressed in the chapters are those of the authors. While Emerald makes every effort to ensure the quality and accuracy of its content, Emerald makes no representation implied or otherwise, as to the chapters' suitability and application and disclaims any warranties, express or implied, to their use.

#### **British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data**

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

ISBN: 978-1-83753-431-9 (Print) ISBN: 978-1-83753-430-2 (Online) ISBN: 978-1-83753-432-6 (Epub)



#### Dedicated to ...

The Humble People of Afghanistan &
My Beloved Parents (Gh. Mohi Ud Din Wani and Sara Parveen)

My Beloved Parents (Gh. Mohi Ud Din Wani and Sara Parveen)
My Wife (Amina Hamid)
Our Daughter (Ummat-Un- Nafiyah) and Son (Ahmad Ehaan Wani).

# Contents

List of Figures and Tables	
List of Abbreviations	
About the Author	xvii
Preface	xix
Acknowledgement	xxi
Part I: Introduction	
Introduction to the Book	3
Part II: Nexus Between Trade and Development	
Chapter 1 Afghanistan's Regional Integration With Central Asia: Identifying Trade Linkages, Economic Recital and Future Latency	13
Chapter 2 Trade Potential of Afghanistan With SAARC Region and European Union: A Gravity Model Approach	41
Part III: Determinants of Trade Costs, Export Supply, Diversification and Growth	
Chapter 3 Drivers of Export Supply in SAARC: Investigating the Cross Evidence From Afghanistan	61

Chapter 4	Export Diversification in ASEAN and SAARC Regions: Exploring Trends Patterns and Determinants Through Empirical Investigation	83
Chapter 5	Trade Costs of Afghanistan With Its Major Trading Partners: Measurement and Its Determinants	105
	Part IV: Policy Concerns: Some Insights	
Chapter 6	Incidence of Reverse Capital Flight to Afghanistan: An Empirical Examination	131
Chapter 7	Afghanistan's Regional and Bilateral Free Trade Agreements: An Evaluation of Trade Effects, Diversion and Creation	155
Chapter 8	Impact of Non-Tariff Measures on Trade Within the SAARC Region: An Empirical Investigation of Afghanistan	181
	Anghamstan	101
Glossary o	f Afghan Expressions	201
Index		203

# **List of Figures and Tables**

Chapter 1		
Fig. 1.	Rates of Survival in Central Asia and Afghanistan (2018–2021).	25
Table 1.	Top 10 Global and Regional Exports of Central Asian Countries and Afghanistan, 2018–2021 (Average).	21
Table 2.	Average Volume of Product Exports Valued at More Than \$10,000 to Each Trading Partner, 2018–2021.	23
Table 3.	Average HHI to Each Trading Partner, 2018–2021.	24
Table 4.	Classification of Central Asian and Afghanistan Exports Based on Degree of Sophistication (in per cent).	26
Table 5.	RCA of CAR and Afghanistan.	27
Table 6.	RCA Based on Broad Product Categories.	28
Table 7.	Trade Complementarity of CAR and Afghanistan Exports (Bilateral).	30
Table 8.	TCI of CAR and Afghanistan.	31
Table 9.	Top 1,000 Import of CAR and Afghanistan (Number of Matches).	32
Table 10.	Annual Growth Rate of CAR and Afghanistan Imports (Average), 2018–2021.	34

#### Chapter 2 Table 1. Afghanistan's Exports and Imports From SAARC and EU, 2021 (in 000's USD). 45 Table 2. Description of Variables. 48 Table 3. 49 Regression Results. Table 4. Existing Trade Potential of Afghanistan With South Asian and European Union Countries Before Giving Shock (Simulation 1). 51 Afghanistan's Trade Simulation and Potential Table 5. With South Asian and European Union Countries. 52 Chapter 3 Table 1. Operationalisation of the Variables. 65 Table 2. Test for Stationarity. 69 Table 3. Estimation of the Kao Cointegration Test. 69 Table 4. Pedroni Cointegration Test. 70 Table 5. FMOLS Estimation (Classical Export Supply Model). 70 Table 6. FMOLS Estimations (Extended Model). 71 Statistics of Model Fitness (Overall). Table 7. 71 Table 8. Cross-Sectional Dependence Test for FMOLS Residuals. 72 Table 9. Estimations Results Based on FMOLS. 73 Chapter 4 Table 1. SAARC and ASEAN Countries' Economic Indicators. 88 Table 2. Export Diversification of SAARC and ASEAN. 89 HH Market Concentration Index of SAARC Table 3. and ASEAN. 90 Cross-Sectional Dependence Assessment. Table 4. 93 Table 5. Results of the IPS Test. 94 Table 6. 94 Results of the Co-integration Test. Table 7. FMOLS Results. 96

Chapter 5		
Table 1.	Trade Cost Trends of Afghanistan.	110
Table 2.	Trade Cost Estimate Equivalents	
	(Agricultural Sector).	111
Table 3.	Trade Costs Estimate Equivalents.	112
Table 4.	Descriptive Statistics Summary.	119
Table 5.	LLC Test for Stationarity.	120
Table 6.	Co-Integration Test Estimation.	120
Table 7.	Results of FMOLS.	122
Table 8.	FMOLS-Based Empirical Results (Agricultural Sector).	123
Table 9.	FMOLS-Based Empirical Results (Non-Agricultural Sector).	123
Table 10.	Cross Model Coefficients Based on Z-Scores.	124
Chapter 6		
Table 1.	Trade Mis-Invoicing.	142
Table 2.	Representation of Capital Flight Based on Unadjusted Estimates.	143
Table 3.	Adjusted Capital flight (Average per Annum, US\$, Millions).	144
Table 4.	Illegal Flows of Capital to Afghanistan.	145
Chapter 7		
Table 1.	Major Export Markets of Afghanistan 2021 (000 USD).	158
Table 2.	Factors Influencing Afghanistan's Imports.	164
Table 3.	Factors Influencing Afghanistan's Imports: SAFTA.	166
Table 4.	Factors Influencing Afghanistan's Imports: BFTAs.	167
Table 5.	Model II: Creation and Diversion of Trade Employing all Free Trade Agreements.	169
Table 6.	Creation and Diversion of Trade in the South Asian Free Trade Agreement.	171

# xii List of Figures and Tables

Table 7.	Creation and Diversion of Trade in Bilateral Free Trade Agreements.	172
Table 8.	Expected Values of Creation and Diversion of Trade (Including All Free Trade Agreements).	173
Table 9.	Expected Values of Creation and Diversion of Trade (Including All South Asia Free Trade Agreements).	175
Table 10.	Expected Creation and Diversion of Trade (Bilateral Free Trade Agreement).	176
Chapter 8		
Table 1.	Overall Trade Restrictiveness Index, Selected Countries in South Asia, 2019.	183
Table 2.	Exports From Afghanistan to BIPS, 2016–2021 ('000 US\$).	185
Table 3.	Exports From BIPS to Afghanistan, 2016–2021 ('000 US\$).	186
Table 4.	Levin, Lin and Chu (LLC) Unit Root Test	100
	Results.	189
Table 5.	Operationalisation of Variables.	190
Table 6.	Afghanistan Exports: Impact of Tariffs Plus NTMs.	192
Table 7.	Afghanistan Exports: Impact of Tariffs Only.	192
Table 8.	Fixed Effects on Afghanistan's Exports.	193
Table 9.	Effects of NTMs Protection on Afghanistan	
14010 ).	Exports (2015–2020).	193

### List of Abbreviations

ADF Augmented Dickey–Fuller AFTA ASEAN Free Trade Area

APPTA Afghanistan Pakistan Preferential Trade Agreement APTTA Afghanistan—Pakistan Transit and Trade Agreement

ARDL Auto Regressive Distributed Lag

ASEAN Association of South East Asian Nations

ATP Afghanistan Trade Policy

BFTAs Bilateral Free Trade Agreements

BIMSTEC Bengal Initiative for Multi-Sectoral Technical and

**Economic Cooperation** 

BOP Balance of Payments

BTA Bilateral Trade Agreement
BSA Bilateral Security Agreement
CAB Current Account Balance
CAD Current Account Deficit
CAR Central Asia Region

CES Constant Elasticity of Substitution
CCE Commodity Composition Effect
CIF Cost Insurance and Freight

CL Civil Liberties

CMS Constant-Market-Share
COR Changes in Official Reserves
CSE Commodity Structure Effect

DAB Da Afghanistan Bank ECA Europe and Central Asia

ED Export Survival

ES Export Sophistication

ESCAP Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the

Pacific

#### xiv List of Abbreviations

EU European Union

FMOLS Fully Modified Ordinary Least Square

FOB Free on Board

GATT General Agreement on Trade and Tariffs

GDP Gross Domestic Product GFI Global Financial Integrity

HHI Herfindahl-Hirschman Product Concentration Index

HOS Heckscher-Ohlin-Samuelson

HS Harmonised Standards

IARTII Intra-Regional Trade Intensity Index IERTII Inter-Regional Trade Intensity Index

IMF International Monetary Fund IRTS Intra-Regional Trade Share

LF Lafay Index

MDE Market Distribution Effect

MENA Middle East Nations
MFN Most Favoured Nation
MNNA Major Non-NATO Ally

NAC Net Acquisition of Non-Bank Private Short-Term

Capital

NAFA Net Acquisition of Foreign Assets
NAFTA North America Free Trade Agreement

NFDI Net Foreign Direct Investment

NTBs Non-Tariff Barriers NTMs Non-Tariff Measures

ODA Official Development Assistance
PTA Preferential Trade Arrangement
RCA Revealed Comparative Advantage

RCF Reverse Capital Flow

RDE Residual Competitiveness Effect
REER Real Effective Exchange Rate
RTA Regional Trading Agreements

SA South Asia

SAARC South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation

SAE Structural Adaptation Effect

SAFTA South Asian Free Trade Agreement

SAPTA South Asia Preferential Trade Agreement

SBC Schwarz Bayesian Criterion

SIGAR Special Inspector General for Afghanistan

Reconstruction

SITC Standard International Trading Classification

SPS Sanitary and Phytosanitary TBT Technical Barriers to Trade

TC Trade Costs

TCI Trade Complementarity Index

TO Trade Openness
TP Tariff Preferential

TR Tariff Rate
UN United Nations

UNCLOS United Nations Conventions of Law of Sea

UNCTAD United Nations Conference on Trade and Development

WEF World Economic Forum

WITS World Integrated Trade Solution

WTO World Trade Organization

### **About the Author**

**Dr Nassir Ul Haq Wani** is the Dean of the Department of Research and Development and a Professor at the School of Graduate Studies, Kardan University, Kabul, Afghanistan. He also serves as an Adjunct Professor at Lovely Professional University, Punjab, India; and Director of Kashmir Research Information System (KRIS), J&K, India. He is the Chief Editor of the *Kardan Journal of Economics and Management Sciences, Afghanistan Development Review* and the Managing Editor of *Kardan Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities*.

## **Preface**

This book combines my writings on international trade and development at Kardan University (KU) since joining KU in 2017. All the papers aim to develop concepts and ideas concerning trade and development in Afghanistan. This book provides a longitudinal study of Afghanistan's involvement in multilateral trade negotiations, highlights the policy propositions for enhancing and expediting trade ties with the region and other trading partners and presents policy discourse on key elements akin to trade escalation and growth.

This book offers a detailed analysis and explores the possibility that economic globalisation may finally deliver to developing countries what they had failed to achieve in five decades of multilateral negotiations – an opportunity to climb the industrialisation ladder and achieve development. The book offers a proposal for revising the format of trade negotiations in a way that helps overcome stalemates and deadlocks. Perspectives on trade and development will interest students and scholars of international trade, trade and development, negotiation, global governance, political economy, international relations and economics.

The volume thus addresses several issues and challenges fairly novel to the Afghanistan economy in general and the trade sector in particular. This book will be most suitable for applied courses on international trade and development for graduate and undergraduate students and for policy and decision-makers in the government.

I benefitted from a personal association with Dr Ahmad Khalid Hatam (Chancellor and Professor) at KU. It is hoped his influence on my work will have prevented detection. I benefited greatly from other faculty members at many presentations, conferences and workshops at KU and abroad. A special thanks to Dr Jasdeep Kaur Dhami (Professor and Dean R&D, CT University, Punjab, India), Dr Nafay Choudhary (British Academy Postdoctoral Research Fellow at the Centre for Socio-Legal Studies [CSLS], University of Oxford), Dr Amruta Deshpande (Assistant Professor, Indira School of Business Studies PGDM, Maharashtra, India) and Dr Suhailah Akbari (Postdoctoral Researcher at Humboldt Universität zu Berlin), for motivating and helping me with the research materials and offering conducive feedbacks whenever needed.

Mr Mirwais Rasa, Mr Muhammad Elyas Naseri and Mr Sadiq Zazai helped finalise the manuscript. For permission to reprint material from which material has been adapted, I am happy to acknowledge the *South Asian Economic Journal*, *Kardan Journal of Economics and Management Sciences* and *Kardan Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities*.

# **Acknowledgement**

Ahlamdulillaahi Robbil" Alamiin. All praise would only be bestowed to Allah subhanahu wa ta"ala, because only with His blessing finally this book could be finished. In this connection, I would like to express my gratitude to a number of people whose admission, permission and assistance contributed to a great deal of the process of finishing this book.

I BLAME ALL OF YOU. Writing this book has been an exercise in sustained suffering along with great learning, and finally, that learning outweighs the suffering. The casual reader may perhaps exempt themself from excessive guilt, but for those of you who have played the larger role in prolonging my agonies with your encouragement and support as well...you know who you are, and you owe me but anyway...

All praises and thanks to Almighty Allah who bestowed me with the potential, ability and opportunity to work on this book. It is a matter of great pleasure to express my cordial gratitude to KU's top leadership including Mr Roeen Rahmani and Ms. Meena Rahmani for the support and encouragement that they have given throughout this research work. The support extended by them throughout the course of writing this book is beyond words.

I express my gratitude to Dr Ahmad Khalid Hatam (Chancellor, KU), Dr Jasdeep Kaur Dhami (Professor and Dean R&D, CT University, Punjab, India), Dr Nafay Choudhary (British Academy Postdoctoral Research Fellow at the Centre for Socio-Legal Studies [CSLS], University of Oxford), Dr Amruta Deshpande (Assistant Professor, Indira School of Business Studies PGDM, Maharashtra, India), Dr Suhailah Akbari (Postdoctoral Researcher at Humboldt Universität zu Berlin), the team of DRD (Mr Muhammad Elyas Naseri, Mr Sadiq Zazai and Mr Mirwais Rasa) of KU and Senior Research Fellows (Dr Inam Ul Haq, Dr Imran Ibn Gani and Dr Sheeraz Ahmad Sofi) at Kashmir Research Information System (KRIS) for their kind support, encouragement and motivation. During the initial stages of book assembly, discussions with them influenced the structure and content of the publication. Their contributions transcend the realm of the book chapters. I express my gratitude for their time, intellect and assistance; however, their passion is what I value the most. I am also thankful to staff members of the library and all other teaching and non-teaching staff of KU for their kind care and cooperation.

Thank you to Dr Daniel Ridge, the Commissioning editor, at Emerald Publishing for guiding and providing kind feedback always. Hemavathi Rajendran

#### xxii Acknowledgement

and Lydia Cutmore of Emerald Publishing were consistently encouraging and forbearing in light of the delays caused by relocations, new employment and other stuff. Additionally, I appreciate Sangeeta Menon's introduction of Dr Daniel Ridge. You are an extraordinary connector.

I would like to express my gratitude to every academic with whom I have collaborated throughout the years and who have imparted invaluable knowledge. There are times when the bureaucracy – forms, deadlines, evaluations and spreadsheets – becomes overwhelming. Simply hearing about how someone's research is assisting in the transformation of circumstances for communities, industries and individuals across the globe, particularly in Afghanistan, is sufficient to remind me why I adore my profession.

Finally, I respectfully offer thanks to my beloved parents (Gh. Mohi Ud Din Wani and Sarah Parveen), for their love, mellifluous affection and sincerity which hearten me to achieve success in every sphere of my life. I am highly indebted to my wife Aamina Hamid for her frequent help, care and encouragement during the course of writing this book. A big thank you to my daughter (Ummatun Nafiyah) and son (Ahamd Ehaan Wani) for making my work easier, by having a cute smile always on their faces. That cute smile is like an energy booster always.

I also pay thanks to my beloved brothers, the most beloved sister and brother-in-law (Khursheed Ahmad Wani, Tanveer Ahmad Wani, Massarat Jan and Shahnawaz Ahmad Zarger) regarding their love, moral support and constant encouragement. Without their encouragement and support, the present study would have been a mere dream.