

# TRANSFORMING STATE RESPONSES TO FEMINICIDE

# PERSPECTIVES ON CRIME, LAW AND JUSTICE IN THE GLOBAL SOUTH

Series editors: Prof Kerry Carrington and Prof Máximo Sozzo

Scholarly perspectives on crime, law and justice have generally been sourced from a select number of countries from the Global North, whose journals, conferences, publishers and universities dominate the intellectual landscape. As a consequence, research about these matters in the Global South has tended to uncritically reproduce concepts and arguments developed in the Global North to understand local problems and processes. In recent times, there have been substantial efforts to undo this colonized way of thinking leading to a burgeoning body of new work. Southern theories, subaltern knowledges and border epistemologies are challenging the social science to open up new ways of thinking about society, crime, law and justice.

This book series aims to publish and promote innovative new scholarship with a long term view of enhancing cognitive justice and democratising the production of knowledge. Topics of interest from the perspective of the global south include - environmental and ecological plunder; gendered violence; religion, war and terror; drug wars; the historical and contemporary legacies of slavery; the contemporary legacies of injustice arising from dispossession and colonisation; systems of punishment and forms of customary or transitional justice; human rights abuses and struggles for justice - all of which threaten the security of peoples who inhabit the global south.

Previous Volume:

Southern Green Criminology: A Science to End Ecological Discrimination Edited by David Rodríguez Goyes

Forthcoming Volumes:

Perspectives on the Histories of Punishment in Ireland Edited by Lynsey Black, Louise Brangan and Deirdre Healy

### International Editorial Advisory Board

Prof Elena Azaola Garrido, Centre for study and investigation Social Anthropology, Mexico

Prof Rosemary Barberet, John Jay College of Criminal Justice, USA

Dr Jarrett Blaustein, Lecturer in Criminology, Monash University, Australia

Prof G.S. Bajpai, Registrar & Professor, National Law University, Delhi, India

Associate Prof Avi Brisman, University of Kentucky, USA

Prof Meda Chesney-Lind, University of Hawaii, USA

Prof Elliott Currie, University of California, USA

Prof Camila Prando, University of Brazil, Brazil

Prof Patricia Faraldo Cabana, University of A Coruna, Spain

Dr Kate Fitzgibbon, Monash University, Australia

Prof Manuel Iturralde, Universidad de Andes, Colombia

Prof Jianhong Liu, University of Macau, China

Dr David Rodriguez Goyes, Assistant professor at the Antonio Nariño University, Colombia

Prof Vera Malaguti, State University of Rio de Janeiro, Brazil

Prof Ragnhild Sollund, University of Oslo, Norway

Elizabeth Stanley, Victoria University of Wellington, New Zealand

Prof Clifford Shearing, University of South Africa, South Africa

Dr Leon Moosavi, Director of the University of Liverpool, Singapore

Prof Nigel South, University of Essex, UK

Prof Sandra Walklate, University of Liverpool, UK

Prof Richard Sparks, University of Edinburgh, UK

Prof Robert White, University of Tasmania, Australia

Prof Chuen-Jim Sheu (許春金), National Taipei University, Hong Kong

Prof Eugenio R. Zaffaroni, University of Buenos Aires, Argentina

Dr Diego Zyman, University of Buenos Aries, Argentina

# TRANSFORMING STATE RESPONSES TO FEMINICIDE

Women's Movements, Law and Criminal Justice Institutions in Brazil

### FIONA MACAULAY

University of Bradford, UK



United Kingdom – North America – Japan – India Malaysia – China Emerald Publishing Limited Howard House, Wagon Lane, Bingley BD16 1WA, UK

First edition 2021

© 2021 Emerald Publishing Limited

#### Reprints and permissions service

Contact: permissions@emeraldinsight.com

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, transmitted in any form or by any means electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without either the prior written permission of the publisher or a licence permitting restricted copying issued in the UK by The Copyright Licensing Agency and in the USA by The Copyright Clearance Center. No responsibility is accepted for the accuracy of information contained in the text, illustrations or advertisements. The opinions expressed in these chapters are not necessarily those of the Author or the publisher.

#### British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library

ISBN: 978-1-80071-566-0 (Print) ISBN: 978-1-80071-565-3 (Online) ISBN: 978-1-80071-567-7 (Epub)



ISOQAR certified Management System, awarded to Emerald for adherence to Environmental standard ISO 14001:2004.

Certificate Number 1985 ISO 14001



## CONTENTS

List of lables	ix
Glossary of Terms and Abbreviations Used	xi
Map of Brazil	xiii
Acknowledgements	XV
Chapter One Feminicide as a Latin American Issue	1
Introduction	1
Genesis, Methodology, and Sources	4
Feminicide: The Emergence of a Concept	5
Thirty Years of Global Activism and Policy Development	8
Putting Gender-based Violence on the Agenda in Latin America	11
The Political Environment of Responses to Gender-based	1.0
Violence in Brazil New Right Politics and 'Gender Phobia'	13 19
New right Follics and Gender Flobia	19
Chapter Two Legislating Feminicide	23
Introduction	23
Legal Change in Brazil: From Domestic Violence to Feminicide	23
Latin American Laws on Feminicide	27
The Cotton Field Judgement	28
Definitions and Typologies of Feminicide	29
Brazil's Anti-feminicide Law	33
Seizing a Legislative Opportunity	33
The Law's Significance and Interpretation	37
Chapter Three Recording, Recognising, and Investigating Feminicide	43
Introduction	43
Recording Feminicide	44
Feminicide Watches	46
Modifying Police Terminology and Improving Data	48
Recognising Feminicides	50
Victims, Vulnerability, and Intersectionality	50

viii Contents

Race and Ethnicity	51
Transgender Women	52
Women Connected to Criminal Groups	53
The Features of Feminicides	54
Investigating Feminicide	56
Diffusing Good Police Practice	59
Chapter Four Prosecuting and Punishing Feminicide	65
Introduction	65
Justice Delayed, Justice Denied: Getting Feminicide Cases to Trial	66
Framing Feminicide in Court: Judges, Juries, and Defence Strategie Jury Trials in Brazil	s 69 <i>7</i> 0
Exculpatory Strategies: 'Honour', Emotion, and Provocation	71
Jurisprudence and Changing Judicial Attitudes	75
Getting to Trial and Improving Conviction Rates	78
Prosecuting more Effectively	79
Speeding up Proceedings	80
Chapter Five Preventing Feminicide	85
Introduction	85
Enforcing Restraining Orders	86
The Maria da Penha Patrols	86
Panic and Protection Apps and GPS Tracking	92
Risk Assessment Tools	94
Primary Prevention	97
Changing Police Cultures	97
Community Education	100
Chapter Six Conclusions	105
Policy Innovation and Diffusion	107
Women's Movements and Transnational Actors	108
Legislation and Implementation	109
Political Environment	110
Challenges	114
References	117
Index	131
··· <del>······</del>	

## LIST OF TABLES

Table 1	Types of Feminicide	33
Table 2	Homicide and Feminicide in Brazil from 2007 to 2019	45

## GLOSSARY OF TERMS AND ABBREVIATIONS USED

bancada feminina cross-party women's caucus in Brazilian

legislatures

Belém do Pará Convention Inter-American Convention on the Preven-

tion, Punishment, and Eradication of Violence

against Women

BO Police incident report (*boletim de ocorrência*)
CCJ Standing Committee on Constitution, Justice

and Citizenship (Comissão de Constituição,

Justiça e Cidadania)

CEDAW UN Convention for the Elimination of all Forms

of Discrimination Against Women

CEVID Committee on Women and Domestic Violence

(Coordenadoria Estadual das Mulheres em Situação de Violência Doméstica e Familiar)

CIM Inter-American Commission of Women

(Comisión Interamericana de Mujeres)

CNDM National Council for Women's Rights (Consel-

ho Nacional dos Direitos da Mulher)

CNJ National Justice Council (Conselho Nacional

de Justiça)

CNMP National Prosecutor's Office Council (Conselho

Nacional do Ministério Público)

DEAMs Women's police stations (Delegacias Especiali-

zadas no Atendimento à Mulher)

delegacia Police precinct (run by the civil police, for the

investigation of crimes)

FBSP Brazilian Forum on Public Safety (Fórum Bra-

sileiro de Segurança Pública)

feminicide the intentional killing of a girl or woman for

reasons related to social norms around gender

roles

homicidio privilegiado mitigated homicide, voluntary manslaughter

homicídio qualificado aggravated homicide

IACHR Inter-American Commission on Human Rights
JECrims Criminal misdemeanour courts (*Juizados Espe*-

ciais Criminais)

MESECVI Follow-up Mechanism to the Belém do Pará

Convention (Mecanismo de Seguimiento de la

Convención de Belém do Pará)

Model Protocol Latin American Model Protocol for the Inves-

tigation of Gender-related Killings of Women

(femicide/feminicide)

MP Public Prosecutor's office (Ministério Público)
MPU urgent protection measure (medida protetiva

urgente)

NGO Non-governmental organisation OAS Organization of American States

Procuradoria da MulherWomen's Advocacy Office in CongressPTWorkers' Party (Partido dos Trabalhadores)SPMSpecial Secretariat for Policies for Women (Sec-

retaria Especial de Políticas para as Mulheres)

STF Federal Supreme Court (Supremo Tribunal

Federal)

STJ Supreme Court of Justice (Superior Tribunal de

*Justiça*)

TJ State-level appellate court (*Tribunal de Justiça*)

UN United Nations

UNSR United Nations Special Rapporteur on Violence

against Women

UN Women United Nations Entity for Gender Equality and

the Empowerment of Women

### MAP OF BRAZIL



Source: https://d-maps.com/carte.php?num\_car=4845&lang=en

### **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

This book is dedicated to the many researchers, academics, and criminal justice system professionals across Brazil whose insights have informed this book. It is always a privilege to spend time talking to individuals who are on the front-line of making change happen and have dedicated their working lives to reducing fear and insecurity for ordinary Brazilians, especially women and girls. I am especially grateful to colleagues in the Brazilian Forum on Public Safety for their support and for their pioneering work transforming the quality of criminal justice data and of public policy on crime and violence.